STATE OF CALIFORNIA

CITIZENS REDISTRICTING COMMISSION (CRC)

In the matter of:

CRC BUSINESS MEETING

THURSDAY, JANUARY 28, 2021

9:30 a.m.

Transcription by:

eScribers, LLC
APPEARANCES

COMMISSIONERS
Derric Taylor, Chair
Pedro Toledo, Vice-Chair
Isra Ahmad, Commissioner
Linda Akutagawa, Commissioner
Jane Andersen, Commissioner
Alicia Fernandez, Commissioner
Neal Fornaciari, Commissioner
J. Kennedy, Commissioner
Antonio Le Mons, Chair
Sara Sadhwani, Commissioner
Patricia Sinay, Commissioner
Trena Turner, Commissioner
Angela Vazquez, Commissioner
Russell Yee, Commissioner

STAFF
Daniel Claypool, Executive Director
Kary Marshall, Chief Counsel
Marian Johnston, CRC Staff Counsel
Wanda Sheffield, Office Technician
Marcy Kaplan, Director of Outreach
Freddy Ceja, Communications Director
Cecilia Gomez Reyes, Outreach Manager

TECHNICAL CONTRACTORS
Kristian Manoff, AV Technical Director/Comment Moderator
Katy Manoff, Comment Moderator

Also Present

PUBLIC COMMENT
Renee Westa-Lusk
Maricela Morales, CAUSE
Moradon Viashin
Sophia
Vanessa Teran, MICOP
Mona
Hindia Pajedro
Moradon
Rahmo Abdi, PANA
Tahwali
Julie Marks, Asian Americans Advancing Justice
Hussein Imo
Karima Fura
Moradon
## INDEX

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Call to Order and Roll Call</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening Public Comment</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach Plan and Materials</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Access Recommendations</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Comment</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Access Motion Passes</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach Plan and Materials Continued</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Management</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Comment</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach Plan motion passes</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Management motion passes</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future meeting dates &amp; agenda items</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing Public Comment</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAIR TAYLOR: Good morning, California. Good morning, staff. Good morning, Commissioners. It is 9:30, January 28th. This is day 3 of the meeting that began -- the meeting of the California Citizens Redistricting Commission that began on January 26th.

My name is Derric Taylor. I'm your rotating chair, along with Vice-Chair Pedro Toledo.

Ms. Sheffield, can you call the roll, please?

MS. SHEFFIELD: Yes. Commissioner Toledo?

VICE CHAIR TOLEDO: Here.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Good morning. Here.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Good morning.

Commissioner Vazquez?

COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Here.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Yee?

COMMISSIONER YEE: Here.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Here.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Here.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Here.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?
COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Here.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?
COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Here.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?
COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Here.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons? I see you.
Commissioner Sadhwani?
Commissioner Sinay?
COMMISSIONER SINAY: Here.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Taylor?
CHAIR TAYLOR: Present. Thank you.
To review and preview where we are on our agenda, we still need to cover item 13, language access. That will be covered specifically at 10:00 a.m. We also need to cover item 14, which may have been addressed in the subcommittee reports. Item 15, outreach plan and materials. Item 16, data management. Item -- there is no closed session for this group of meetings. Item 18, discussion of future meeting dates. And we will conclude with public comment.
So right now we will go directly to public comment. Katy, if you can read the -- if you can invite our public in, I'd appreciate it.
PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, good morning Chair.
In order to maximize transparency and public participation in our process, the Commissioners will be taking public comment by phone.

To call in, dial the telephone number provided on the live stream feed. It is 877-853-5247. When prompted to enter the meeting ID number provided on the live stream feed 976-7934-9222, for this week's meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply press the pound key.

Once you have dialed in you will be placed in a queue to indicate when you wish to comment. Please press star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator. When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic message that says the host would like you to talk, and press star 6 to speak.

If you would like to give your name, please state and spell it for the record, but you are not required to give your name to give public comment.

Please make sure to mute your computer or live stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during your call.

Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when it is your turn to speak. And again, please turn down the live stream volume.

The Commission is taking general public comment at
this time.

And we do not have anybody in the queue.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll give pause for a few minutes so that everyone can catch up.

(Pause)

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And we do have someone in the queue.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Invite them in.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: The floor is yours. If you would like to state your name, please spell it for the record.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Yes, this is Renee Westa-Lusk, R-E-N-E-E is the first name. Last name is W-E-S-T-A, and then there's a hyphen, and then it's Lusk, L-U-S-K.

I sent an email Monday night, January 25th in follow up to Commissioner Le Mons' request to have a communications and engagement plan for outreach, just as an example from a small rural community. And it was about a little over a page. I could not upload it into an attachment on the website, so I just typed it all in the email. I just wanted to know if Commissioner Le Mons received it, and I also addressed it to all Commissioners at the top.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Should I respond?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes. At least respond to the receipt
of the email, if you're able to, Commissioner Le Mons.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I don't recall seeing it. I will double-check. But as of -- I don't recall seeing it. I have checked my email. But I will look now. I think she said that was sent on Monday evening.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, on the 25th.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Okay, I will double-check.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Yeah, it was sent to the area that you can send emails to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Ah, so staff would have to let us know whether that was received.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Ms. Westa-Lusk, we will look for that email and we are working hard to address those concerns that you expressed earlier regarding a form for Commissioner speaker requests, and ability to attach files and PDFs to our website, or the form email -- the form on the website page. So thank you. So we are addressing those concerns.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay. If we need to contact the Commissioners, the only way I know how to is that email where it says "Contact Us" and you put your name, and data, and all that, and then you just type out. Is that the only way to contact the Commissioners?

CHAIR TAYLOR: My understanding that our contact email address is also on the agenda.
Commissioner Sinay, do you have an answer?

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Well, I think right now, because with outreach I'm more than willing to email me directly, and that would be my first name dot my last name at CRC.ca.gov. And we'll make sure to get it to everybody. Or, you know, send it to staff. But I just wanted to volunteer myself since I know it can be frustrating.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay, so your full first name, patricia.sinay@CRC.ca.gov. Okay.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Exactly.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay, thank you.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Chair?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, sir.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yeah, I just wanted to respond to that. Thank you, Commissioner Sinay. I do think it would have been more appropriate for staff to let the caller know how to send information, particularly if it was something that was addressed to me. To have Commissioner Sinay step up to say to send it to her directly, I'm not quite sure I understand what that thinking was about.

So I think we need to have -- whatever is going to be the way that we have people respond to us, it should
be clear to all of us how that works. And the staff, or
whomever, the executive director, our communications
director, I think one of those individuals should have
stepped up and let the caller know how to talk to us.

So this is nothing against you, Commissioner Sinay,
but I think you just filled in the silence and there
shouldn't have been any silence. So I wanted to say
that, that's why we have a communications director.
And if we have these methods by which the public wants to
reach us, then we should do that.

And I didn't think that while they can email us
directly, I didn't think that that was really -- I
thought we wanted our staff really keeping track of our
communications and all of that. So I'd like to be clear
on how we're going to handle communication from the
public.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Ceja, do we have a response
to that?

Mr. Claypool?

DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Yes. And I apologize, I didn't
think Mr. Le Mons that there was a silence as much as
that I'd already saw that Commissioner Sinay had her hand
up. And so I was waiting to say that we should flag that
in the info mailbox that is on our website.

I'd like to also say that we generally respond to
anyone that -- or not generally, we respond to everyone that sends in an email to us. And we will run that email down from Ms. Lusk and then we will respond to it, and make sure that it moves forward to you. So that's it.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. And I'm also looking at our agenda, on page 1 of the agenda it does state: Written comments may be submitted by the Commission's website at wedrawthelines.ca.gov/contact public comment.

So it is listed how to contact us on the front page of the agenda.

Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: I think that the more important is what follows that immediately: Or emailed directly to info@crc.ca.gov. If someone wants to send an email, and particularly an email including an attachment that is where to send it, and that is listed on the agenda. And as soon as the new website is up and running there will be a better way to submit it through the website. But the instructions for sending comment by email do work and we trust that staff will be -- will continue to monitor that info@crc.ca.gov mailbox and distribute anything that needs to be distributed to Commissioners. Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

Commissioner Sinay -- Sadhwani.
COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Thanks. Just for clarity, who's checking that email box? Is that communications or is that -- it used to be Raul. I don't know who's responsible for that at this point in time.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Claypool?

DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So we're in the middle of the transition. I would assume it is still Raul, but I'm writing that email right now and I will respond to Ms. Westa-Lusk today, personally, and we will set up -- we will set up a system so that we can make sure she can upload her documents and she'll have a direct line.

CHAIR TAYLOR: All righty, thank you. Katy, do we have anyone else in the queue?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: No, Chair, that was it.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Seeing no one else in the queue, we will move to our next agenda and close public comment.

All right, agenda item number 13 is behind held until 10:00. So that puts us at agenda item 14 and it's my understanding that's probably covered in the subcommittee reports, unless Commissioners Vazquez and Sinay have a different opinion.

COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: No.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. That moves us to agenda item number 15, Outreach Plan and Materials.
Commissioner Fernandez and Commissioner Kennedy. And we'll be on this agenda item until we begin the conversation at 10:00 a.m. regarding language access, if it's not completed.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, thank you. So from the last meeting, and Commissioner Sadhwani was still part of this process, what we did is we went back and we looked at all the comments we received not only from the Commissioners, but also from public comment. And we made some changes on the video.

And then we have received some recent feedback from Commissioners and obviously, we haven't had time to make any changes or discuss those recommendations.

Before I get started, I do want to thank our Deputy Executive Director Hernandez, Communications Director Ceja, and Communications Manager Gomez Reyes, they've just been very helpful and just great in terms of updating the information, and providing feedback. So thank you so much.

And then one thing, I just wanted to make a clarification. One comment that was made last time is we wanted a short video and a long video, given the length of time that we would have. And so what we came up with is we came up with a long video that would be about thirty minutes long. And that we felt would be
sufficient time to keep the audience engaged, as well as allow sufficient time for questions, in case you only had an hour.

And so then what we did from that thirty minutes, we cut some of the slides out to make it a fifteen-minute video. And then, also we don't have the script because we are making an assumption that there's going to be other comments. So we felt once we agree on the video in terms of the size we can go, you know, work our way backwards and finalize the script.

And then also what we're going to have are some collateral documents, the frequently asked questions, our fact sheet, and also our flyer. Again, as we go through that if there's any grammar type changes, please just forward that to us. We just kind of want to make sure that we have the information that we need to -- that's appropriate to convey to the public.

And you know, I'm trying to think if there's anything else. Commissioner Sadhwani, did you have anything else to add before you hand it off to Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: No, I think that's it. I think you covered everything. And I just wanted to say I've so enjoyed working with you. I think it's been wonderful and my apologies for stepping back. But I
think Commissioner Kennedy is going to do a marvelous
job. I know his attention to detail will be impeccable.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes. And the feeling is
mutual.

So I'm going to hand it over to Communications
Director Ceja, and we're going to walk through the long
video. Right?

DIRECTOR CEJA: Yes, we're going to go through the
PowerPoint presentation.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, I'm sorry, it's a
PowerPoint presentation. I keep saying video, but it's
PowerPoint.

DIRECTOR CEJA: I know. I was like we're not there,
yet, but we will be.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I know. I'm sorry, my mind
was kind of -- oh, that's okay we don't need to know
where my mind was.

DIRECTOR CEJA: Thank you so much. So talking about
the videos just shortly, we have retained the services
for a videographer so we will start producing some of
those in the following weeks. We have our first meeting
tomorrow.

I'm going to share my screen so that you all can
follow the presentation. So we have had different
iterations of this. This is not the first time we're
seeing this. We started with a general presentation that
was really basic, and then we had the idea from
Commissioners to create multiple PowerPoint
presentations, a fifty-minute, a thirty-minute, forty-
five, and an hour. But the committee decided that it was
best to do a long and a short version.

Today I'm going to present the long version because
I think Commissioner Kennedy has an idea that we should
do an even larger presentation than this, and then have
Commissioners pare it down as needed for their
presentations.

So I'll go through this. And then, at the end if
you have suggestions on what needs to be included in
here, we'll have that conversation and any additional
changes.

But like Commissioner Fernandez said, if it's
wordsmithing or typos, just email us and we'll make the
changes.

So on this page if you look here, if you look at the
pictures you'll see that it's a little more diverse. We
did try to get an agricultural worker in there, a person
wearing a ceremonial headdress or a scarf, and then
various other individuals that represent, really,
California, keeping in mind the gender balance as well.

We changed the title to California Redistricting
Basics, no longer the 101 title we were using.

When we talk about what is redistricting, we wanted to have a very basic definition. We did have different suggestions from legal to change the wording, but the committee decided that this was -- it was good as is. And we did include Commissioner Taylor's design here to explain what we are doing. We're going from Census to redistricting, and then to vote in 2022. So that's really the bulk of the work that we're doing here.

The third slide -- let my computer catch up here. The third slide is really explaining the differences in redistricting efforts throughout the state because we want to delineate that we are really in charge of the state redistricting process, but at the same time we will have county redistricting processes, city redistricting processes, and school districts. And if you look at the numbers here, this is going to become very confusing to the common resident in California to know that there's four different -- or there are four different redistricting efforts going on at the same time, with 58 counties, 482 cities, and 977 school districts.

So at every opportunity we have throughout this presentation, we will be explaining that we are in charge of the top level, the state, which will be charged with congressional Board of Equalization, Senate and Assembly
districts redrawing.

The next slide really talks about why independent redistricting matters. We have used examples of other states. In 2012, Pennsylvania, the Democrats receives 51 percent of the vote for congress, but won only five of its 18 seats. And it's really talking about gerrymandering, without necessarily spelling out gerrymandering on the slide, but we can work that into the narrative to let people know why this process has developed.

And in 2016, Maryland Republicans received 37 percent of the votes for congress, but won only one of its 8 congressional seats.

And in California, from 2002 to 2010, only one California congressional seat changed parties and only two incumbents lost in all 253 races, which means people are keeping their seats and not making it competitive.

The graphic here illustrates if you had, in a state, sixty percent blue which is traditionally Democrat, and forty percent red, these are two different ways to split it up so that blue wins, and another way for red to win. And it's just, again, illustrating the different ways that we can divide up a district so that it gives one party a competitive advantage over the other.

Redistricting factors, we retitled this slide. It
talks about the Census and the fact that redistricting is the next step after the Census. Reapportionment, when the federal government reallocates the number of house seats among states. And then, fair representation. The fact that some communities have been left out on purpose, and fair representation is really when you have individuals who represent the community that they represent.

The next slide talks about why we redraw district maps. And of course, this is something that we had prior. I did make changes to the little stick figures here so that they're a little more diverse. It's not just a male/female. Wanted to be very sensitive to that. The fact that the diversity of the state is not just geographically, but the people that live in California.

So people are born, they die, they move. Communities grow in strength areas where there was once roughly the same number of people become lopsided, so communities change. And accordingly, we have to change the districts that encompass these communities.

And then, going through the history. Prior to 2010, Proposition 11 in 2008, the Voters First Act that gave birth to this Commission and this process. Prop. 20, in 2010 that added congressional districts. The move from Census to redistricting. The 2010 Commission, which was
the inaugural Commission. The 2020 Redistricting Commission. And other states that have similar processes, like Arizona, Colorado, Idaho, where independent commissions draw the lines.

Then we walk through the Commissioner selection from the application process to the number of people that actually submitted, the people that were screened and interviewed, the legislative strikes and that process, the lottery giving you your first eight Commissioners, and then the selection of the final six.

And who we are. We finally have a complete series of pictures for all the Commissioners, so thank you so much, Commissioner Andersen with an "e". We will not make that mistake again.

We have your city where you come from and your political party just to demonstrate that this is really divided equally so that there's representation from Republicans, Democrats, and no party preference.

Now, in previous conversations we talked about actually demonstrating what a Board of Equalization, a Congressional, a Senatorial and an Assembly district look like to give people an idea of what we were really drawing.

So we here talk about Commissioner duties, the outreach and public input meetings, which is the heart
and the bulk of the work that we're going to be doing, and then drawing the maps. The fact that you're going to be drawing four maps, four different maps. Roughly fifty-three for Congress, four Board of Equalization maps, forty Senate, and eighty Assembly.

Outreach zones, we did change the -- oops -- we did change the zones from numbers to letters. And so I redid the map, relabeled it, and color coded the zone, county, and Commissioners to align with the map itself.

Then, we went to line drawing criteria. So when you're drawing maps what exactly, what lens are you following? The Act spells it out very clearly. So I wanted to make sure people knew what that was. And then, the weight that we follow. So equal population, VRA, contiguous districts, respecting the boundaries of cities, counties, neighborhoods, and communities of interest. Being geographically compact. And then nesting districts.

And that's spelled out in this graphic here, which I have made a one-paper, also for social media and our website use that folks can share with community members.

Now, communities of interest, letting people know what it is exactly. Shared experiences, shared transportation facilities, living standards, work opportunities, so here we actually give Commissioners an
opportunity to talk to the audience. And ask them, how do you define your community? Let us know what geographic boundaries or landmarks, really let us know what your community is and what the boundaries are.

I did illustrate here different examples for landmarks that you can find throughout California. I added the mountains. I added the little mountain house, the palm trees to represent the beach, and made other changes. And again, made sure that these stick figures here where not just the male/female, but were a little more diverse.

We then move on to your voice. Why is it important as a community member to get involved and your role in the process? And we talk about historically underrepresented communities being left out of the process. And where elected officials were selecting what communities they wanted to represent, as opposed to now the communities choosing why they want their representatives to be. So that is captured by the "Your Voice is Your Choice" slogan there.

And again, participating in the process steps and suggestions, familiarize yourself with the criteria and the process, organize your community. And these were taken from some of the literature from our community partners. Clarify your goals. Testify at hearings. So
we need to go over how to do that, how to testify and
what information would be crucial and informative for the
Commissioners as they're drawing the lines. And advocate
for your community. If you don't define your community,
someone else will.

We then introduce the COI tool, "Draw My Community
Too". This is an actual snapshot of what the website
looks like. It was given to me by the Statewide
Database. And here, in addition to the map technology,
it provides the sample questions on the side, on the
left-hand side, where people will be able to add
narrative, describe their community, tell us about your
community and what shared interests you have. So we'll
dive deeper into that with the participants so that they
know what to expect when they jump onto this website.
That will be connected to our site as well.

And then, just to share a timeline so people know
what deadlines we're up against. This, of course, has
changed as of yesterday, when we had the conversation
with the latest news from the Census. So we're going to
have to chance this accordingly. I do know that
education meetings will be ongoing according to
yesterday's conversation, again. So we'll make the
changes.

And we were very mindful to indicate that in June,
when we're doing the line drawing they're pre-maps, like
some of you suggested, hence to delineate the fact that
public input meetings in July through August we'll be
doing drawing sessions as well. But that will change
according to the updated chart hopefully we'll receive
from Commissioner Kennedy.

And then lastly, to request information sessions
contact the Commission. It has all our information, a
direct contact with Marcy who's taking the lead with
coordinated these meetings.

And then, finally, our social media handle so that
folks can follow along with our work as we go along.

And that's all I have. It's eighteen slides
currently, but of course it's open for additional
suggestions. And I think that's the input we'll be
taking now.

And I'll stop sharing so that you can see your
audience, Mr. Chair. There you go.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, Director Ceja. So that
looks like a wonderful presentation. We will pause,
though, right here, before we go on to further discussion
regarding this item, and we're going to move to Language
Access Recommendation, as we stated we would. And then,
we will return to this agenda item.

So we're going to quickly pivot. So I'm going to
give the floor over to Commissioner Fernandez and Commissioner Akutagawa. I think Commissioner Akutagawa had to leave, so the floor will be solely to Commissioner Fernandez, but I'm here to assist you as needed.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you, Chair Taylor. I'm not going to take that as a sign of being abandoned, but that's okay.

But before we do start, I do want to thank Executive Director Claypool, Deputy Executive Director Hernandez, Communications Director Ceja, and Outreach Manager Kaplan, and obviously fellow Commissioner Akutagawa. We spent many hours going back and forth, and coming up with this outreach plan and recommendation. And we're actually feeling very good about it. It's pretty open and we feel that it will be inclusive. And we're going to do as much as we can to provide interpreter services, as needed.

And so at the last meeting we presented our preliminary analysis and that document -- and I recommend that if you have time, or if you haven't done so already to go back to that document because it did have some very good recommendations and considerations that were shared by our panel members during the presentations in October, November, December, and it's something that we can use as we move forward into our education meetings, as well as
our input meetings.

And then for today, it was a three-page document and it was on the website so hopefully, everyone's had a chance to review that. And our goal is to move forward with our language access in terms of contracting for translation and interpreter services. Because as we all know, the contracting process, it can take a while. It can take -- but we're hoping that it's an interpreter and language services is on a California Multiple Award Schedule, a CMAS. So that does shorten the process, but we would like to get something in place as soon as possible.

And so what I'm going to do, I'm just going to go straight into what our recommendations are as we've already discussed what our process was last time. So just let me just pivot over to recommendations really quick.

And so last time what we used for our recommendation was on the information from the Secretary of State on elections and precincts. And so what we did is we went back and we actually compared -- there's so many different documents that talk about language access, but the one thing that we did notice was that most, if not all of them, the twelve non-English languages that will be translated by our Communities of Interest tool was
also common in those other documents. And so with that, that's how we're going forward.

Our recommendation is for translation services, so that will be for written materials, and that we contract for the same twelve non-English languages that will be used in our Communities of Interest tools.

And those are Arabic, Armenian, Chinese, simplified and traditional, Cambodian, Japanese, Korean, Persian, Farsi, Punjabi, Russian, Spanish, Tagalog, and Vietnamese.

And at this time our recommendation is to translate our frequently asked document -- I mean, yeah, our frequently asked questions, our flyers and our factsheets, once we get those finalized, to have those translated in the twelve non-English languages.

And then, also to translate the non-English language inputs from the COI Tool into English, and that would be for all languages.

And another recommendation is that we translate our non-English written public comments and testimony submitted to the Commission into English.

And in terms of our interpreter services for our Commission input meetings, and this is a critical piece that we want to make sure we communicate when we're conducting our educational sessions, or even our meetings
is that if a request can be made to the Commission at
least five working days prior to a Commission meeting
that interpreter services will be needed, the Commission
staff will work to procure the interpreter services for
the twelve recommended non-English languages noted above.

    And for those languages beyond the twelve that we've
noted above, again we ask for a five-business day advance
notice, and Commission staff will work within reason to
try and provide the requested interpreter services. And
if the Commission cannot or is unable to find a qualified
interpreter, then the Commission will work within reason
with the local communities and/or community-based
organizations to try and provide those interpreter
services.

    And we did make a note here that we are not
specifically identifying American Sign Language because
we are required to provide that interpretation during our
meetings and we will continue to do so.

    And in terms of other translated documents, the
Commission will continue to review the outreach materials
and we will determine whether or not some of those
documents or videos will be translated and if they are,
we'll report those out accordingly.

    And again, the Commission, as last time, will work
and partner with community-based organizations, Tribal
leaders, Tribal organizations, ethnic media, and other institutions who are trusted entities, messengers, and communities across California to collaborate on our outreach and engagement.

The development and distribution of culturally appropriate and accessible in-language materials.

Independent review of translated documents to ensure appropriateness of the translation and interpretation at public meeting, depending on the languages spoken in that area.

And so at this point our recommendation is to adopt the recommendations or our actions -- the recommended action is to adopt our recommendations and to also contract for translation and interpreter services in the non-English languages that I mentioned earlier, that are similar to the COI tool languages. And that's it.

And yes, Commissioner Akutagawa and I spent many hours, and I think it was -- was it Communications Director Ceja talked about the things that, you know, he thinks about when he can't sleep at night that's the things we -- this is what we think about when we can't sleep at night.

So we're very happy to bring this forward. We feel that this is a recommendation that is very inclusive. We're going to do our best to provide interpreter
services for all. No guarantees, but we're going to work for -- we're going to work with our community-based organizations and trusted leaders as much as possible, if we cannot find interpreter services.

So I think with that we'll open it up.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you very much. I know you guys worked hard on this subject matter, weighing all of the factors. I appreciate the work.

Any questions or Comments from Commissioners?

Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you, Chair.

Commissioner Fernandez, I'm just wondering if in the -- in your discussions there was any discussion of producing any of our materials in Braille. If not, I would propose to speak to the Braille Institute out here in Rancho Mirage, and get their sense of the extent to which there might be a demand or need for any materials in Braille, and report back at a future date. I've had contact with the Braille Institute in the past when the organizing election observation visits in Riverside County. So I'm happy to contact them.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yeah, do you want me just to respond to that?

CHAIR TAYLOR: You can respond, yes.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. Sorry. We did
discuss it, but of course at some point in time we really have to like narrow down our focus. But I would appreciate, actually all of us would appreciate if you could do some further research, and that would be separate from this discussion. But thank you very much.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Vazquez?

COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes, I think that's a great idea to explore, Commissioner Kennedy. And I also maybe in the interim since so much of our work is digital, I know there are a lot of resources and folks willing to sort of look at our website, look at our, in particular, Instagram to make sure that we are captioning things for screen readers. So folks who don't read Braille, but use screen readers so that they can audio hear what is written on their screen. So there are devices and apps that folks use. So that would be at least a nice interim thing to do so that we can make sure that our digital efforts are accessible.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

Ms. Johnston?

MS. JOHNSTON: Yes, and I should have noted this also a requirement of the ADA that websites be accessible to screen readers. And I've talked with Fredy about that and he's assured me that our materials will be --

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Kennedy?
COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: In fact, I would have been participating in the Riverside County Voting Accessibility Advisory Committee this morning, but the meeting just started and we're otherwise occupied. But I have reached out to the Riverside County VAAC to let them know that I would like to engage with the members of the VAAC on some of these questions.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Any other questions or comments from Commissioners?

Commissioner Turner?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Thank you, Chair. I may have missed and I didn't want to lose the opportunity. When we talk about working with the trusted messengers for interpretation that's outside of what we're able to provide, was there a provision there for stipends for that interpretive service?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, do you have a response?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, thank you Commissioner Turner. So as a matter of fact the request was made five days ago for interpreter services for our meeting today. We were supposed to have a couple of calls. And so we were able -- our Administrative Director Villanueva was able to set up a contract with our interpreters.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: And I should have also said
COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I would hope that would be the same in terms of if the -- yes, you're absolutely correct. If it's not -- if it's beyond the twelve, especially for the COI tool input and also any type of written inputs --

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: -- I would expect it, but I could defer to Executive Director Claypool.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Okay great, thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Kennedy, did you have an additional comment or question?

Any other comments or questions from Commissioners?

Commissioner Le Mons?

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I have a question on a follow up to Commissioner Turner's question. I know we had talked about the distinction between interpretation and translation, so I just wanted to understand I think more clearly Commissioner Turner's question, because I also thought that some of what the grant opportunities were going to take care of that. So I think that was a budget question and sort of how we're going to fiscally handle those types of requests. So I'm not sure I fully understood the question, Commissioner Turner, so.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yeah, I think you're going
down the right path. Right towards the end of the
presentation Commissioner Fernandez said about the
trusted messengers for translation, and left it there.
But I wanted to tie in for everyone that's listening, and
it's not just an assumption that the trusted messengers
would then fill gaps without any expectation of a stipend
or some budget that is something that we're looking for.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Claypool?

DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So in our discussions with the
Language Access Subcommittee we talked about that,
Commissioner Turner. And I believe that we're going
to -- I don't believe -- we are going to set aside funds
in the outreach budget to make sure that community-based
organizations or individuals who assist us can be
reimbursed for their expenses. We certainly want to make
sure -- they're helping us, we want to make sure we pay
them accordingly for carrying that load.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Commissioner Fernandez,
are you looking for a vote from the Commission today?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, I would like a -- I
guess I could make the motion. But yes, I'd like a vote
today so that we can move forward in order to procure
these services, translation and interpreter services. So
I guess I'll make the motion. Or maybe Commissioner Le
Mons would like to make that?

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I'll also help you out there and say I'd like to motion that we accept the proposal from the Language Access Committee's recommendations.

COMMISSIONER SINAY: I second. Sinay.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Any further discussion?

All right, we'll move to public comment. Katy, can you invite in the public, please?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Chair.

In order to maximize transparency and public participation in our process, the Commissioners will be taking public comment by phone. To call in, dial the telephone number provided on the live stream feed. It is 877-853-5247. When prompted to enter the meeting ID number that is provided on the live stream feed, it is 976-7934-9222 for this week's meetings. When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply press the pound key.

Once you have dialed in, you will be placed in the queue. To indicate you wish to comment, please press star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator. When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic message that says the host would like you to talk and to press star 6 to speak.

If you would like to give your name, please state and spell it for the record. You are not required to
provide your name to give public comment.

Please make sure to mute your computer or live stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during your call.

Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when it is your turn to speak. And again, please turn down the live stream volume.

The Commission has requested to make available translators for Oromo and Somali speakers who wish to provide public comment relating to today's agenda item 13, Language Access Recommendations. The Commission has interpreters available. Callers wishing to use an interpreter will simply need to say Oromo or Somali so that the appropriate interpreter is ready.

We do have several people in the queue.

Chair, can you call on someone?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, Commissioner Fernandez.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, I just wanted to confirm are interpreters available, are they ready to go and available? I just want to make sure we're set.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, okay, I'm going to verify that right now.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. And as soon as they're available, Katy invite in our callers.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So we do have several
people in the queue. I did just want to make an
announcement. I hope that everybody in the queue can
understand me at this point. That if you would like to
comment, please press star 9 to raise your hand. And
we're verifying the interpreters.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, you had
another comment?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: My only other comment was
maybe we can translate the star 9 in Somali and Oromo.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I was thinking that. I'm
trying to figure out where the -- some of the people in
the queue may be our interpreters because they were
joining by phone. So I'm just going to do this. Do we
have the phone numbers for the interpreters?

MS. MORALES: Hello.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Hi.

MS. MORALES: Good morning. Am I on?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: You are. Do you need an
interpreter?

MS. MORALES: No, I don't.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. You do not have to
share your name. If you would like to, please state and
spell it for the record. And the floor is yours.

MS. MORALES: Thank you. Good morning. Buenos
dias, Commissioners. My name is Maricela Morales,
M-A-R-I-C-E-L-A, the last name M-O-R-A-L-E-S. I serve as Executive Director of the Central Coast Alliance United for a Sustainable Economy, or CAUSE, based in Ventura and Santa Barbara Counties.

I come today to lift up the tens of thousands of Mixteco people along the Central Coast, as well as the Fresno area of California. Mixtecs, as they're called, are indigenous people from the southern region of Mexico. They serve mostly as farmworkers for California's multi-billion agricultural industry that provides fruits and vegetables to California, the nation, and the world.

Mixtecos, there's about ten, twenty, thirty there's multiple thousands of Mixteco peoples. Many of them do not speak Spanish, much less English. They speak their indigenous language. The good news is that there are at least two CBOs that have interpreter, professional interpreter capacity. MICOP, known as Mixteco Indigena Community Organizing Project, services the Central Coast. And CBDIO, an acronym for Central Binacional Para El Desarrollo Indigena Oaxaqueno, services the Salinas Valley and Fresno. You might want to look them up for interpreter access, language access when you're doing outreach to the Central Coast and the Fresno area. Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, do you have a
response?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Actually, thank you very much Ms. Morales. Is there any way that you can send me the names of those two CBOs, that information. I think you have been in contact with Commissioner Fornaciari. Would you mind sending that to him, if you haven't already? That would be very helpful. Thank you so much.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Can you invite in our next caller?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: The floor is yours. Do you need an interpreter.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We are unmuting the interpreter.

Hello? Interpreter, can you please speak to the caller?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes. My name is Celio Osomon (phonetic). I'm interpreting for Oromo in San Diego. I have one client that's on the line right now. He didn't speak up on Oromo.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: He is -- both of your lines are open for the Commission.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Very good.

MR. VIASHIN: (Through Oromo Interpreter) Yes, he say my name is Mohammad Viashin (phonetic). I'm
calling -- okay, he say my name is Moradon (phonetic). I speaking up on Oromo. Explain the reason why we needed Oromo as part of the language that's for the commenter. We have a lot of several problems in our communities. As soon as whenever we go to service centers, like community, like hospitals, and also when we go to take it a work to office, public grocery centers, wherever we go the State of California don't have own translator for Throng (phonetic), it is all the state. They bring the translator from different state. So when they bring the translator from different states there is multi-culture in our communities. Some of people doesn't understand what the translator says. But the language sometimes is similar sometimes it's different according to the region people come from Ethiopia -- from Ethiopia or (indiscernible) different culture and different accents. So while we go to hospitals and then maybe any public places we need our translators. So we have been suffering a lot, a lot. And we need to put this on considerations that we can use our translators. We have a lot of people that is in our community who can translate our language for us. Please help us on these issues.

In addition to all the points I mentioned while we go to schools in the different public sectors, they have
written on their language beneficiaries in different languages. But on Oromo it doesn't exist on writing. And also it doesn't have that option, like Vietnamese, Chinese, Tagalog, Arabic, so on. So in our part Oromo, big Oromo community living in San Diego around areas of Bay Areas, L.A. areas, around and in Southern California. So we needed these Oromo as a part of official working language in public center, in government center sectors.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, sir. We will take in consideration your comments.

OROMO INTERPRETER: I have another client that's on line right now, who is going to speak it right now.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Hang on. Hang on. We have to wait for the moderator.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay, real quick, the Oromo interpreter, if you could possibly interpret the instructions of pressing star 9 to raise their hand so that I know they want to speak, is that possible?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, I'll tell them right now.

(Interpreting instructions in Oromo)

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much. And the Somali interpreter, if you could unmute yourself? No, aren't they right here? And if you could interpret in Somali, I would appreciate that. Okay, they're
working on getting the Somali interpreter unmuted. But I do have the Oromo a lot more people raised their hands.

So however, the interpreter, sir you said you have someone on the line with you that would like to make a comment?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: That's separate from what I have in the queue?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. Would you like to interpret that comment and then we can go forward?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. So we'll start with --

OROMO INTERPRETER: I can go ahead, okay.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Perfect. We'll start with your client and then we'll move forward.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Sure. Okay, my client is missing. I think the line is push him out from the system.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Hold on. Hello.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: I'm the Somali interpreter. I'm translating for Somali community. Did you call me?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. So sir, your
client is now through. He was labeled incorrectly.

OROMO INTERPRETER: From Oromo. From Oromo I have right now some clients with me. She's going to speak it right now.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. For the Oromo interpreter, if you could just hold on one second.

The Somali interpreter, your line is now open. Are you there?

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Yes, I'm there.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much. Would you be willing to interpret the instructions of pressing star 9 to raise their hand so that I know that they would like to share a comment? And then, we are going to go back to the Oromo interpreter and move forward from there.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Okay, thank you very much. I'll do now.

(Interpreting instructions in Somali) SOMALI INTERPRETER: Okay, go ahead I translated.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much.
And our Oromo interpreter seems to have disappeared. Hung up. So I'm not sure what to do right now.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yeah, just see if we can go to our next caller and hopefully --

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So the issue is that
everyone that's raised their hand has been interpreted
for Oromo or Somali and I don't know which language.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Which one's which.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So if we can maybe just
give one sec. I don't -- he was calling in, so maybe his
phone dropped the call. I'm sure he'll be right back.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Okay. Okay, we'll work through it.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Sorry guys.

(Pause)

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thanks to all the Commissioners for
their patience in this process as we work through
something that we've perfected just yet.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We got him back. Hold
on.

OROMO INTERPRETER: I'm on.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. Hi, we're back.

Awesome, that's what I like here.

Okay, I'm going to go to our next caller. For the
interpreters, I don't know which language and so if you
can both be alert that would be fabulous.

OROMO INTERPRETER: It's Oromo.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you. Your line is
open.

SOPHIA: Hello.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: And that was Sophia in San
Diego. She's reading all the (indiscernible). Sophia has difficult in the language barriers of language and she has difficult to communicate with healthcare offices, public offices, and other language has access like the Arabic and Tagalog and all those language. But the Somali is not translated in the State of California. And on one occasion she had an appointment with the DMV, she'd been waiting one month and a half. She's a mother who's struggling, an immigrant who is striving to feed her kids and to work for them. Because of lack of translation, the translator who was available at the DMV he didn't appear, so they had to cancel that appointment and she has to wait a very -- another long time. So she's requesting that the (indiscernible) and the State of California authority to consider this matter and give Somali language a priority. We have a lot of -- from Somali and she's kindly and humbly requesting (indiscernible) --

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Hello?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, hello.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: That's what Sophia said.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I'm sorry?

CHAIR TAYLOR: That's what she said.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, that's what she said.

Oh, okay, perfect. Thank you so much.
That's all she said. That is all she said, yeah.

Thank you. We will take under consideration her comments. Thank you.

You're welcome. Thank you very much.

We have more. We have lots more callers.

Katy, if you can invite in our next caller, please?

Yes. The next line is open. Whatever language, you state it.

Hi, yes. Hello, my name is Vanessa Teran and I'm a Policy and Communications Associate at the Mixteco Indigenous Community Organizing Project. It's based in Ventura and Santa Barbara Counties. And MICOP also works on statewide projects, such as being the lead of the Census statewide outreach for farmworkers in 2020. And presently is working on state legislation for language access.

I wanted to share with you that there's an estimated 170,000 Mixteco indigenous peoples in California. And they're concentrating in the following California regions and counties, which are the Central Coast, Central Valley, Los Angeles County, Napa, et cetera.
And so we really wanted to offer, MICOP wanted to offer the following language access recommendations which would be to create systems of orality and visual components that can support individuals to understand the redistricting process. We feel very strongly about this due to health literacy levels, and the complexity of language in redistricting.

We wanted to note that one in five adults in California actually have low levels of literacy and not all can read and write in their native language. So we appreciate that. We can be reached at -- I can be reached at Vanessa.teran@Mixteco.org, or by phone at 805-612-7568, or our webpage which is www.mixteco.org. Thank you for our time and for allowing us to submit public comment.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, appreciate your comments.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And to our next caller. The floor is yours, if you need an interpreter.

MONA: (Through Somali Interpreter): That was Sophia and Sophia say thank you for giving us the time to speak up on --

MONA: Mona. My name is Mona (phonetic).

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Mona. Mona, I'm sorry, that's Mona. And she thanks for the time that you gave, that she speaks on the difficult (indiscernible) that she has
with the language. The Somali language is not a written language. And wherever we go, she said, whether it's (indiscernible), hospital, DMV, Social Office, we don't have translators and we have to take our children to translate for us, children who attend schools. And you can imagine that children, when they translate, it's not even good that they know some of the information and that children is not even bad behavior or, you know. So and she's requesting that the panel to consider to approve the Somali language to include it, like the other language Arabic, and other language that's written in the State of California. And we have a very large Somali community around California, everywhere. And she thanks again for letting her and thank you very much.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: All right.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We will take her comments under consideration, thank you very much.

MS. PAJEDRO: Oromo translator.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

MS. PAJEDRO: Oromo.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Hold on, I have a client on the line right now who was going to speak it.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay, thank you. He's with you, correct?
OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, please.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. If he's with you -- is he physically with you or do I need to open a specific line?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay. I think she pushed number 9 and she found number 9, she raised her hand or star 6, she unmuted.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, so I'm going through a long list of callers. There are quite a few. In fact, I have nine still with raised hands. So I don't know which one she is, but I will open her line.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, I think her phone number 1886, the last four digits is their phone, 1886.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, she's the next caller. Here we are.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Her line is open.

OROMO INTERPRETER: You can speak right now.

MS. PAJEDO: (Through Oromo Interpreter):

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, she say in Oromo my name is Hindia Pajedo (phonetic). We have been suffering a lot, a lot when immigrant is come from African to United States. They don't speak English and we don't have translator in here California, especially when people are arrived over here at adult school. They're trying to
learn English, they don't know anything when --
especially when registering, do everything, some stuff
like that. We have been suffering a lot because we don't
have Oromo translators in California, especially in San
Diego over here. There's a bit Oromo community lives
around here. We have been suffering at DMS, hospitals,
adult schools, us too. For example, when we go to
clinic, at the time of clinic we don't have any Oromo
translator at the clinic. They call them up the phone,
you're from different -- the people who speak Oromo from
different state, she doesn't speak (indiscernible) Oromo,
the one we know. And is account we have been suffering a
lot. Please put this issue on considerations. Try to
help us on these issues. We need a lot. All
(indiscernible) -- people who stay in their home. So we
have been suffering a lot.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll take your comments
under consideration. Thank you.

MS. PAJEDO: (Through Oromo Interpreter): You're
welcome.

OROMO INTERPRETER: I have another client on the
line, too. I think the last four digits --

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I'm sorry, sir, I didn't
get the last four that you said?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Okay, the last four digits was
9306 is on the line, too, 9306.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I do not have a 9306 on the line.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay, 2512?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I do have that. That's actually the next caller.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, very good.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In universally alignment here.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Do you have another 9490 on the line, 9490?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. Actually, they're after this caller that you just asked for.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Okay, very good. Yeah, 9490, her name was Karima Fura (phonetic). So please she can -- she want to speak, too.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. Yes, absolutely. The 2512 -- oh, there you go. They're open.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

MORADON: (Through Oromo Interpreter): Okay, my name is Moradon. Especially we have the same issue whatever people arises. And also even if our children went to (indiscernible) -- by the time we take them to the school, the one we tell them and the one that tell to the teacher different. So if you guys put this issue on
consideration and to bring or hire some people who speak in school, any public facilities, he can't understand us, so we can't communication (indiscernible) -- whatever we had it. Special again, on other (indiscernible) -- any (indiscernible) they have their own translation. But on Oromo side, we don't have it. Please put this issue under consideration in the schools, in hospital, in clinic, in public welfare places, (indiscernible) -- the same issue he mentioned again.

OROMO INTERPRETER: I have another client that's on the line. The last --

CHAIR TAYLOR: We appreciate the prior caller's comments. We'll take those into consideration. I think our moderator has everyone in queue, so she's getting there, thank you.

OROMO INTERPRETER: You're welcome. Yeah, 9490's on the line, too.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, she is. And they're line is open.

MS. FURA (Phonetic): Oromo.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Speaking Oromo.

MS. FURA: (Through Oromo Interpreter): Hi, the committee, my name is Karima Fura. And she say the first time when I come to the United States over here, I have been sick and been taken to hospitals. When I went in
hospital there is some information that the doctor he
want to explain to me, but I don't know English. There's
no way he can explain to me. And there is some
information, my personal information that he doesn't
disclose with anybody, but he can only disclose with me.
So I have been suffering all the time. No one can help
me out, even if my husband at the time with me, and they
don't want to share it -- but they want to share the
issues with me. Finally, they don't find any
translations and my husband little idea, even if he
doesn't put for me hundred per cents my idea, but he
translated with the doctor, between me and the doctor.
But starting that day I've been plagued with depression.
So that is what happened to me because of the lack of
translation. That is I end up with the depression she
say, right now. Her name is Karima Fura.

So please put this issue on the considerations. Not
only me, there is a lot of people like me who have been
suffering a lot on these issues. So please help us.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll take your comments
under consideration.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you. I'd like to
ask the remaining six people in the queue, if you would
like to make a comment, if you could press star 9 to
raise your hand.

And then, I'd like to ask the Oromo interpreter if they could interpret those instructions one more time. The Oromo interpreter, sir? Sir? Oromo?

The Somali interpreter, are you still on the line? Somali interpreter? Can you press star 6, Somali? Oh, yes. Hi. Can you possibly interpret the pressing star 9 to raise your hand one more time, for Somali? Hello? Somali or Oromo interpreters? Both of you are here.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Oromo's on the line. I'm here on Oromo right now.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, thank you. Can you interpret one more time the instructions of pressing star 9 to raise their hand?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Sure.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.

OROMO INTERPRETER: It didn't work.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Sir, Oromo?

OROMO INTERPRETER: I did.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, you did?

OROMO INTERPRETER: I did it.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. We didn't hear you.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Hello, Somali interpreter is here.
PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Somali Interpreter could you please possibly press star -- or interpret star 9 instructions for the remaining people in the queue?

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Okay. (Interpreting instructions)

Yeah, I just did do the translation.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: You're welcome.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We have a few more people that have raised their hands. 8495, your line is open.

MS. ABDI: Good morning Commissioner, my name is Rahmo Abdi. I'm a community organizer with PANA, Partnership for the Advancement New Americans.

First, I wanted to say we appreciate all the staff and consideration that has gone into creating this language access plan. And I wanted to thank you all for working so hard to make a translation available today.

I'm calling to urge you to offer COI materials in live translation in both Somali and Oromo language.

There's a large Somali and Oromo community throughout this state, particularly here in San Diego, and those people do not speak Arabic. And we have worked hard to acclimate those communities in civic life, including but not limited to participate in the Census, local and state advocacy campaigns, and also educating them about
upcoming redistricting.

We work with a large number of community members who are motivated and excited about being part of the redistricting process. Like you see today, a lot of people are calling from the community.

But we'll be challenged to engage those people or those communities if the proceeding are not in their language. And it is not fair to us organizations to take on the responsibility of translation and interpretation, while at the same time doing the work of organizing, analyzing maps, and also turning out community for public comments.

And as you know, redistricting has a lot of technical language. Having a family member or a friend translating for something they're not familiar with it means important information can slip through the cracks. And you need an official translator to make sure we're all getting the same information.

This is why I urge you to provide or we urge you to provide with redistricting material, translation services in both Somali and Oromo language. And I thank you so much for all your work. Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

Katy, can you hang on for a second?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes.
CHAIR TAYLOR: We are at our mandatory 11 o'clock break. But due to the fact that we have the language services on, if possible I would like to continue until we complete these callers, if that's okay with staff.

MR. MANOFF: Stand by Chair.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Claypool?

DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So it's purely a question as for our VSS and ASL, so they're shaking their heads yes, so we're good, too.

MR. MANOFF: Chair, we are good to go.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

MR. MANOFF: We are good to go.

CHAIR TAYLOR: I assume that's okay with Commissioners that we complete this? Yes, nod.

Okay, Katy, can you proceed please. Thank you.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

Your line is open.

MORADON: Oromo.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oromo Interpreter. There we go.

OROMO INTERPRETER: I have on Oromo line.

MORADON: (Through Oromo Interpreter): Okay, for Oromo, again my name Moradon. At the time we have all of the United States and all over the world we have been suffering with pandemic COVID-19, by the time our patient
is sick and can we take them to hospital, so they don't allow other people to go inside with our patient. So people -- right now people was (indiscernible) -- and we have been people dying without proper translations. So this is the main issue right now when (indiscernible) -- that's why I (indiscernible) --

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Sir, Interpreter?

OROMO INTERPRETER: This is Oromo translator, did you hear me?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir. Were you done?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes. I'm done, yes. I have another client on the line with me, 8866 on the line.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay, thank you so much. 1866, okay.

OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo).

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, I'm asking -- they have to press star 6 to unmute themselves.

OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo). Okay, I think 1866 is not responding. I have 9306 on the line, too.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I don't have that person in the queue.

OROMO INTERPRETER: Okay, 8866 is on the line. Can you see that, that number?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So oh I did that.
OROMO INTERPRETER: The last four digits of his phone number, I saw 8866.

(Speaking Oromo).

Yeah, he's coming right now.

TAHWALI: (Through Oromo Interpreter): He say thank you very much first of all to have this opportunity for me. My name is Tahwali (phonetic). First of all, the State of California is very big, they have big population, big communities in the state. So we don't have any translators. The big issue when we go to the (indiscernible), when you go to the DMVs, when you go to any public places, schools, welfares, the California was as a big state is a translator, especially in Oromo communities. We have been suffering a lot. And so we need our people to work with us with our native languages to translate for us. Thank you, so much. Put this issue on consideration. He say, as he say.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Thank you for that call.

OROMO INTERPRETER: You're welcome, sir.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir. We have six more callers in the queue. If you would like to make a comment, could you please press star 9 to raise your hand?

And if the interpreters would be willing to interpret those instructions again, I would appreciate
SOMALI INTERPRETER: Somali Interpreter.

(Interpreting instructions into Somali). Somali is translated.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir. And we do have a raised hand. And the line is open, 6158.


And I just wanted to call in first and foremost to say thank you to the Commission, and the Language Access Subcommittee, and staff, for all the thought you bring into this, and the work you're putting into making it happen. We really appreciate your commitment to expansive coverage, committing to the top twelve languages, but also working hard to make sure smaller language groups can access this really important process.

As prior callers have pointed out really eloquently, language access is an urgent need across so many areas of civic participation, so we appreciate the efforts being put into making redistricting inclusive as well.

We do support the adoption of the new proposal and appreciate the flexibility. But I did want to ask for a clarification and just a restatement of commitment to adequately compensating community organizations and
community members for assisting with both interpretation
and with translation of any written documents.
Organizations that might be applying to get outreach
support in the form of grants should be separately and
additionally compensated for any translation work they're
doing. Those often go hand in hand but they are, you
know, both laborious tasks that should be duly
compensated for.

I also just wanted to know we acknowledge that there
are some logistical difficulties in making all this
happen and we appreciate that you're starting this week
to really put it into place.

A couple of suggestions from some of our past work,
one challenge we've seen is arranging translation and
interpretation on short notice. So we would recommend
that you identify translators potentially for each region
based on not just the top twelve languages, but some of
the other predominant ones, or some of the ones we
identified in the letter we submitted to the Commission.
Just to make sure you have folks lined up, in case
interpretation is required, in advance so you don't have
to scramble.

And then, we also recommend figuring out and testing
out a way to make sure callers are able to hear
interpretation throughout the hearing, not just for, you
know, the public comment portion.

Zoom has some functions where you can set up different interpretation lines, so ideally, persons should be able to go to your website and see the video feed, and identify which number to call to get interpretation in their language throughout the course of the hearing and through public comment, so that live interpretation is happening the whole time. And then, it will have to switch over for the comment period to make sure that you all can hear the interpreter interpreting the commenters' contribution as well.

So I'm sure that will be a bit of a little sticky process, but it's clear you're committed to making it happen and we greatly appreciate that. So thank you.

One final note is if you do have the capacity, it would be great to see some basic outreach materials, particularly something like a short video for folks with less literacy being translated or interpreted into some additional languages beyond the top twelve. Some languages we noted in our advocacy letter for regional coverage such as Thai, Hindi, Bengali, Pashto and Hmong would really benefit from additional resources from you all.

I believe in the last discussion Commissioner Yee mentioned the power of seeing your language reflected in
the statements and materials from important institutions, and so we just would uplift finding some extra funding and time to make a couple more languages covered in your resources would be very helpful.

So thank you so much for your consideration.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, Ms. Marks for your call and comment.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And to our next caller.

Your line is open, sir.

MR. IMO: (Through Oromo Interpreter): My name Hussein Imo (phonetic). As a South California, State of California is big and we have been suffering a lot. For example, what happened on me for the last like two, three months, or couple months ago I take one of my family relative to the hospital or clinic. And they don't want to disclose their information to me and they call out some translation from different state, who she doesn't understand her language. And I'm her son, by the time I go with her in hospital they don't trust me. Because she know my language, I know her language, so I can disclose. They don't want to disclose her personal issues with me. And they're going to bring translator from different state.

And we have been suffering the same issue with
DMVs, in clinics, in hospitals, in other places, and other (indiscernible) -- any public places. Please, this issue put into consideration as the State of California is big, we need our translator with our languages as we are a big state.

And also with this COVID-19 a lot of people is right now suffering with this COVID-19 as currently, especially even from our communities. By the time we take them to hospital, they don't let us know to go with him and we translate for them. Also they don't know what's going on, they don't understand and the (indiscernible) -- how to explain it. By the time they bring the translator he doesn't understand because our language is multi-broad language. That's why I put this issue in consideration. We have our people in California please try to have our people for California for us. We have a lot of education in our own communities and big. Put this issue in consideration. Please help us he say, Hussein. Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll take his comments under consideration. Thank you.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: If there's anybody in the queue that would still like to make a comment, if you could press star 9 to raise your hand indicating you would like to speak.
Chair, most of the people, the numbers that are in the queue are people that have spoken, that were with the Oromo interpreter, the last four of their numbers, and no one has raised their hand the last two times we've made the announcement, and no one's raising their hand now. So we can make another announcement, if you'd like.

You're on mute, Chair.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. One more announcement and then if not, we'll close public comment.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. So one more time if you would like to comment, please press star 9 to raise your hand.

And then, I'd like to ask the interpreters if you could please interpret those instructions one more time, that would be great.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: In Somali. (Translating instructions). We have Somali translated the instructions.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir.

And the Oromo interpreter?

OROMO INTERPRETER: Into Oromo. Yes. (Translating instructions). Yes, I pass the message.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much, sir.

And nobody raised their hand Chair.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Thank you, Interpreters.
Thank you, staff.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, wait, wait.

CHAIR TAYLOR: We've got one. We've got one.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: One more. It is actually the one number that had not shown.

And your line is open. Oromo?

MS. FURA: Oromo.

OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo).

MS. FURA: (Through Oromo Interpreter): My name is she say -- oh, Oromo translator. My name is Karima Fura. I come back again. There is a lot of our big Oromo communities out there in San Diego and live somewhere. So we are the minority group is today to come like very fraction number of people to come in to give you the idea, because of the meeting that was not longer. That's why for next time we bring a lot of peoples. If you have time, you guys will bring it. But a lot of our communities suffered a lot and we need to put this issue on consideration. And we need a translator. Please help us. Thank you very much for listening. And we need this issue to put on consideration, the State of California they need their own Oromo translator. Thank you very much, as she say.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.
CHAIR TAYLOR: And Katy, I think we have one more.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, we do. And your line is open. Oromo?

OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo).

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

OROMO INTERPRETER: I'm explain to her. Your line is open. If you are speaking Oromo, the line is open.

MORADON: (Through Oromo Interpreter) My name is Moradon. As he say, thank you very much to bring this article on consideration. We really appreciate it from our special place of (indiscernible). And please, please we need it, we need this translation even if our people is suffering a lot and different things, but everybody mentioned the same ideas. So people mention more ideas. And to put this issue on consideration, we really appreciate it. Thank you very much, as he say.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. I appreciate the call. And I think seeing no one else in the queue, we will close public comment.

Thank you, Translators.

OROMO INTERPRETER: You're welcome.

SOMALI INTERPRETER: Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, staff, for understanding us going a little longer than usual.
So Commissioners, we'll take our required 15-minute break and we'll come back at 11:40, and we'll pick up right where we left off. Thank you. Thank you for your patience.

(Whereupon, a recess was held from 11:26 a.m. until 11:41 a.m.)

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Good morning, welcome back to meeting day 3 of the California Citizens Redistricting Commission. We left off after having just received public comment regarding our language access recommendations.

Any other questions or comments from the Commission before we proceed to a vote?

Commissioner Fernandez.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I just wanted to -- just a brief thank you to everyone, all of our -- everyone that called in. And personally, as being an interpreter and translator since I can remember for my parents, my aunts, my uncles and my friends, an advocate for others, I understand how frustrating it can be to try to ensure that there's appropriate translation and interpretation, and communication is received accordingly. And that's why we try to make this language access as inclusive as possible. So thank you again. I know you have busy lives and it really warmed my heart to have you call in.
So thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. I appreciate your comments Commissioner Fernandez.

Any other questions or comments from the Commission?

Ms. Sheffield can you call the roll for a vote?

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo?

Commissioner Turner?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Vazquez? Commissioner Vazquez?

Commissioner Yee?

COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons?

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sadhwani?

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sinay?

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Taylor?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Motion passes.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you for all of the work that the Language Access Committee has put into that, into this. Thank you.

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you. Before we move off this topic, I would like to bring up, which one of the callers mentioned is back when Commissioner Yee mentioned the idea of putting like a little bit of a line in multi different languages on our website to say hey, just a short, like, you know, you count too. I would like the Language Access Committee to look into that. Like it's a separate contract having a couple of lines in multi different languages, with a little short sentence and saying -- maybe doing a link to one of our CBO partners that had language translations. So it would be actually people who have -- rather than our full twelve, just a short line about, you know, and the idea being maybe we can help the people in different language be
directed to how to use the COI tool, something like that.

Just or something like that, I like that idea of just a short blurb on our website in multiple different languages. If I could sort of throw that idea to the Language Access Committee to look into, and that can be just a small, separate contract as opposed to the big, you know, translating all the documents, that sort of thing.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you Commissioner Andersen.

Commissioner Le Mons, did I see your hand raised?

Oh, I'm sorry. Commissioner Fernandez, did you have a reply?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Actually, I think the directors are happy to address it.

But I think with language access and our recommendation going forward, I don't want to say we're going to sunset our subcommittee, but I think going forward it would be any requests would be handled by the communications area. That was our intention at this point. But we'll still move forward in terms of the contract, and RFP, whatever language, of course, that needs to be written up for that.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Director Ceja?

DIRECTOR CEJA: Just a friendly reminder that the California Statewide Database is including instructions
on how to use the COI tool in those twelve languages. So
once we have that literature we will definitely plug it
into our website so folks can access instructions in
their different language.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. All right, we will now
return to agenda item number 15, the outreach plans and
material.

Director Ceja? I guess we last left with you ending
your reveal of our PowerPoint deck, correct? Correct, so
then I'll give --


CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. So I'll give it back to
Commissioner Fernandez and Commissioner Kennedy.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. So I think we were
trying to figure out how best to move forward with this
because we do have the collateral documents. I'm
thinking with those documents, and also due to time
constraints, because I'm really interested in the data
management piece of it.

If there are changes in the language or if you want
to see additions, if we could have the Commissioners and
the public, as well, if they could forward that to us to
the subcommittee to include Communications Director Ceja,
that would be best.

I'm not sure, Chair Taylor, how you want to do -- if
you want us to actually go through the PowerPoint
presentation to see if there's changes there or if you
want to handle it the same way where they can forward
their comments to us. Either way is fine.

CHAIR TAYLOR: I'm fine with the forward and then we
can adjust it, and any changes or amendments, you can
offer them up in either your report or a subcommittee
report.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Uh-hum.

CHAIR TAYLOR: All right. I see on the agenda we do
have the -- we also have the 2020 Commission Logo
presentation. Is that something that we've already
covered with the new logo?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Commissioner Sinay.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay.

COMMISSIONER SINAY: I just have a quick question.
You know, with subcommittees and all that, if we could
have clarification from counsel, are we supposed to be
sending it just to staff and then staff puts our comments
all together and then shares it with the other
subcommittee members, or do we cc the subcommittee
members? I've done both and so I know that I've messed
up somewhere.

MS. MARSHALL: You know, we're currently working on
protocol and I'll try to get something out to you by
tomorrow, because I see the responses are pretty much inconsistent and I want us to be consistent, so before I give a definitive response. But we'll get something out to you quickly.

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, Chief Counsel Marshall.

Thank you.

Any other questions or comments? All right, so that will conclude agenda item number 15 and we can move on to agenda item -- oh, Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Sorry Chair. We got sidetracked there for a second, but I'm not sure we ever finished on the logo presentation.

So where are we formally on the logo presentation?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Ceja?

DIRECTOR CEJA: That was a leftover from previous agendas. That was just ported over. But the new branding has been released and has been applied to all agendas and future collateral materials.

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Okay. It's just still the "we" and the "the" still get lost a little bit depending on the size and because of the color. It's very weak and it tends to drop out.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any other questions or comments? Commissioner Yee?
COMMISSIONER YEE: Yeah, while we're in public
session I want to mention for the PowerPoint I'll be
sending in a note about our discussion yesterday about
not receiving public input in educational sessions. I
think slide 13, especially, is a little bit unclear on
that. So I'll be sending that in. I just wanted to
mention that publicly.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you Commissioner Yee. And I
also have a note considering the same. Thank you.

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes, I will be sending --
again, publicly, I really want us to emphasize that in
the criteria for drawing compactness that's not the
definition. It's not about shape and my shape, it is
not. And we really -- that's going to be an issue that
comes up, and up, and up, and we must be totally clear.
So our definitions in the PowerPoint are misleading. And
in one case that's not it. And so I will be definitely
sending in things like that.

Also the emphasize in terms of we mention testimony,
and we've never talked about testimony virtually at all
until this document. We're talking about, you know, the
drawing your community, getting involved with your
community, our COI tool, and we all the sudden shifted in
this document. So I will be submitting things for making
changes in the documents to correspond to that.

But it's great work, great work, but it does need
some shifting to be consistent and correct.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you Commissioner Andersen.

Any other questions or comments? All righty, that
will conclude agenda item number 15.

We'll move on to agenda item number 16, Data
Management, with Commissioners Ahmad and Turner.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Thank you Chair. Commissioner
Turner and I will take it from here. We have quite a few
things to go over with you all, and particularly to
gather your feedback and input about where we are in the
process right now.

So just a quick recap. As you know, we have been
talking to a whole bunch of different folks about what we
would need in order for us to implement a successful data
management tool within our organization.

And Commissioner Turner, I have had numerous
meetings with USDR, the United States Digital Response,
over the past couple of weeks to continue to refine the
process we are thinking could potentially work for us.

So we want to go over certain items today. So there
are four documents posted online for agenda item number
16. The document labeled "16 Data Management
Subcommittee Checklist" is a document that outlines the
other documents we will be reviewing for this agenda item. And this is to keep us organized and to be able to make sure that we're looking at the specific documents of discussion, and then also our focus questions which are for the group to react to. This document also outlined our recommended action, which we will discuss at the end of our presentation today.

So just jumping right in, the first document that we will be reviewing is titled "Partnership Options from USDR". So this is the three-page document with charts. Would it be helpful for you all if I did a screen share?

Yes. Okay.

Commissioner Turner, can you field in case I can't see folks?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Okay, awesome. Let me jump into a screen share. All right, are we seeing the document?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Okay, awesome. So this document highlights the different options that USDR proposed to Commissioner Turner and I, and that we are bringing back to you all for feedback, suggestions, thoughts, reactions, all of the above.

So USDR outlined two options that they saw, based
off of our conversations. The first option is that USDR assists us in building out the Data Collection Management Analysis and Publishing Tool. And we, as the CRC, hire that data analyst who would then be using that tool to manage all of the inputs that we're going to be getting.

The second option, jumping below to the row titled "2"; the CRC hires a data analyst. And there's one minor addition to this. We would also hire the product manager and an engineer to build out that tool and then hand it over to the data analyst, who would then manage the input, the data collection, and analysis, and publishing of all of the inputs that we gather.

They also went ahead and listed out some pros and cons for each of the options.

And then, if you jump to page 2 and 3, it's the same options as discussed, however they have outlined a little bit more clearly the different roles that USDR would play and the role that our hired data analyst would play, and then as well as our role as the CRC.

This chart does not reflect, based off of our conversation on Monday, since we weren't allowed to change material that late in the game these charts don't reflect the inclusion of a product manager and an engineer within option 2.

Commissioner Turner, am I missing something or
COMMISSIONER TURNER: I don't think you're missing it, other than for the clarity the product manager and the engineer both would be hired by CRC under that option number 2.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes. And if it's helpful to delineate what those roles are, a product manager would be managing the product. They would see the development of that product from end to end. So starting from the fact finding of what kind of features do you all need in a data collection tool? What exists out in the market? Do we need to build something from scratch to be able to hold what we are asking for? They would take those answers, figure out what the solution is, work with the engineer to actually code and develop that tool, whether it's in existence already, like Airtable has come up in the past, in which we could make edits, et cetera, or, if it's to build something from scratch. We don't know yet, we haven't had this conversation with us, as well as with USDR of what that would look like.

But from the first step they have identified that if we choose option 2, we would need to hire all three of those roles in order for us to be able to successfully
create a tool and employ that tool in our data collection efforts.

Do we have questions on this particular document? And I am open to holding questions off until the end of our presentation or we can go document by document, however you all want to go.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Ahmad, can you run through your presentation and then we'll run through the questions, please?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Sure, awesome. So this is the first document and this is our first question for all of us is to really think through whether we would want to go with option 1 or with 2. And I would like to add that USDR was not shy about saying that they do want to help us with this project. They're really eager. I believe, in my personal opinion, that they do have the skill set to be able to assist us through this process, as well as the network for the necessary skills to build out our tool.

If we move along to this document, our second document is a data flow diagram, so it is also one of the attachments. Let me bump over to that one. Can you all see this? Commissioner Turner --

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: -- can I get a verbal? Okay,
awesome.

So this document outlines the flow of our data from the people back to the people, essentially. We went through various iterations of this document with USDR, mainly being able to -- trying to tease out all of the different tools that -- all of the different inputs that we would be receiving.

There's a question mark in there and that is not an accident. I should have added another question mark because I have several questions on this flow. But for now, let's go over this flow.

So all of our data will be coming from Californians. They would funnel that data to us through two different mechanisms, whether that's through the COI tool or some other means that is not the COI tool.

So let's start with following the line through the COI tool. So a Californian will hop on their computer or cell phone, access that COI took through the captcha, so this captcha will be able -- hopefully, will be able to limit the bots that enter. They would go into the COI tool, input their information, the map along with their commentary. That COI tool would then pop out the output, which we have discovered many times in our talks, and with Karin's insight that is going to be a CSV file, shapefiles, and PDFs.
From there, there's two different paths. Either that COI tool information comes to us in English or it comes to us in another language. If it comes to us in another language, it would need to be translated into English. So the ones that come to us that are in non-English languages would then funnel into the translation piece back to our data management team.

The data management team would then funnel this back into the COI tool in English, so it feeds into the main database.

Now, if the COI tool information comes to us in English, it will flow directly into that main database.

I will come back to this question mark at the end.

So that is one path that information from Californians will get to that main database.

The second path that we had identified in our conversations is that folks come to us directly. So whether that be through emails, written comments, meeting notes, phone calls, verbal testimony in person maybe, and any other option that we are not even thinking about right now that is not the COI tool.

From there, that information flows directly to us, the Commissioners, and we determine where that flows next. So there's two paths that we've identified in our conversations. One path is to the data management team...
directly. Another path is to the line drawers.

So if this non-COI tool data comes to us in English, we would be able to either flow that information to the data management team if it's comments, qualitative data, any sort of data that falls within that realm.

If it's map data, so information about where my community lives, where my community is located, it's from 1st Street to 10th Street, et cetera, we would flow that to the line drawer.

If this non-COI tool data comes to us in a non-English language, that first initial step would be the same. It would flow to the data management team for nonline drawer information, get translated, and then populated through the COI tool into the main database.

If it is map-related information, in a non-English language, it would need to be translated, theoretically our data management team would handle that, and then flow directly to the line drawers who would draw that and populate shapefiles.

Those shapefiles will then jump into the shapefile database that we all know that Statewide Database would have, or our line drawers would have, sorry. And also flow directly into our main database.

So at this point all of the information, theoretically, that we're getting from Californians has
flown into our main database.

From here we would apply the filters. So this could be filters to remove harmful language. It could be filters to identify unusable entries, so we could apply a filter that if every cell is empty, put it aside. If there's any other types of filters we could think of at that time, we would add that in this step. That would then populate a filtered database, or a clean dataset from which we can work from.

This filtered dataset will then go two directions. It's the same dataset, but it would go into two different directions as a whole. So one direction would be back to the public, so they see exactly what the dataset looks like that we're -- or the database looks like that we are working from. And then, it will also go to our analyst, who would be working with the database to come up with the visualizations, the synthesis, the qualitative analysis that exists in that main database.

That information would then go back to us as the Commissioners to inform our decision making, and then also flow back to Californians so they can see what we are using to inform our decision making.

Now, this question right here. Theoretically, if this is an automated process for let's say myself to jump onto the COI tool, punch in my information and click
submit, if this path right here is truly an automated process I am not sure, with the skills that I have, if there is a way to intercept that automated process to identify non-English submissions.

The other place where this translation piece can go is potentially in that filter step, where we could apply that filter to identify non-English submissions.

The other question that I have is regarding the line drawer, and the line drawers will in the analysis, if any. And I will leave it at that because I am not sure where that sits right now and I would love to hear from my colleagues about that.

So this is something that Commissioner Turner and I came up with based off of all of the conversations that we've had in our meetings, the back and forth that we've had with USDR. It is not final by any means. This was just to put on paper, so we have something to react to, something we can look and be like, hey, well we didn't think of XYZ. We should move it like this or like that.

And then, also something we can have on paper as we go through the recruitment process, if we choose to hire a data analyst, so that they can also react to it and be able to identify any gaps that we may not have seen in the pre-planning process. So that's that document.

The last document we wanted to review is the draft
timeline. Let me see if I can -- So this draft timeline, granted we just learned new information yesterday, so it might change. It will change. But this draft timeline outlines the different steps that the data management component of our organization would be taking in order to develop out that process.

So in February we are thinking about creating that data management system plan and the staffing plan, so this ties into us figuring out the different options we want to pursue with our partnership with USDR, whether that be option 1 or 2.

And then, we would need to develop a duty statement for a data manager position. I have been told by staff that it might not take as long as last time, but we will see where that goes.

We would also develop that RFI and begin the recruitment process for a data analyst. And that would require that twenty-day posting of the duty statement for the -- I'm sorry, the duty statements for the data manager, the RFI is for the data analyst, and that twenty-day posting. So we're thinking that can happen in February.

And then, when we jump to March we would start that interview process, looking at both of those roles that we are hiring, a data manager and a data analyst, if we
choose to go that route, going through the interview process, bringing forth recommendations, and then including that onboarding that's going to be led by the staff executive team.

And then, that data manager and analyst working together to identify the process in which they would be managing all of the information going in.

We have done a lot of the head work for it and of course, things might change. They obviously would have expertise in this area. Commissioner Turner and I are just, you know, learning as we go and doing a lot of research on our own. And then, they would be able to identify the different detailed components of such a tool, whether it be a completely separate tool than, you know, Airtable or Tableau, or whatever it is, a built out tool in combination with the COI tool, and how to actually pull all of that information in.

And then, we would actually have an opportunity to review that process, of course, and troubleshoot -- bring forth any troubleshooting items as well.

This goes into a lot of details, number 3 in late March. So developing a manual review of the inputs, outside of the COI tool. So figuring out which -- you know, which piece of information that comes to us from a non-COI tool perspective, how is that information
handled? So that top part of the right-hand side of that table. So emails, hand-drawn letters, verbal testimony, the data manager would develop a system of protocol within that team to identify, okay, if we get this type of information, this is the process it flows to get back to us as the Commission, and back to the public.

And then, in April 2021 the hiring of temporary staff, if there is the need for the temporary staff. So looking for data entry folks. This is where we would potentially have college students; interns play a role in this process as well.

That's as far as we got. This is before, you know, we learned changes within the timeline for the Census and other changes. So this is draft as well, open to being edited and changed, but this is where we're at right now. Before we move on to the recommendations, though, I think I need to know if I'm making any sense at all.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: And before we even open it up, I want to say for the amount of meetings the data, the individuals that we interviewed, the feedback and support was received, I'm impressed with Commissioner Ahmad, how she's been able to pull it altogether and present to you. We were all over the board in trying to make sure this made sense and would flow.

And I was in the meetings and I'm like, yes. So
Commissioner Ahmad, your office is amazing. So we are ready for sure for now questions that you have. But I just had to, even before we go into it give her that public praise because that presentation was wonderful.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Comments and questions from Commissioners? Go ahead.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Okay, Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you. First of all, yes, I want to say that I am both impressed and inspired by the quality of work and you know, the obvious learning that has gone on. I think we're all better off for this. You know, I was asking in one of the recent meetings for a more complete data flow diagram and this is wonderful. This is incredibly helpful.

My one question about it is I'm not fully understanding the purpose of the shapefile database if all of the shapefiles are also in the main database. And if they're all in the main database, do we achieve the same thing just by having a flag on the record, or something?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes. And you're referring, Commissioner, to the shapefile database on the right side, under shapefiles. You know, so what we were told when we asked the same question is that the line drawers will maintain their own database for different drawings
that they're trying on, and what have you. So it may be they will possibly have shapefiles there as drafts, or as drafts that may not be in the other, official database. Is I think how it was explained that the line drawers, I guess from 2010, they maintained their own files just based on what they're trying on.

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Fernandez?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, yes thank you. Thank you to both of you for this presentation. I'm trying to catch up to all of the knowledge that you have and I'm sure I'm not even going to get close to that. So I do have quite a few questions.

I'll go through like the admin questions quickly, though. Like for the data analyst position, do we have that position already established? Because I know that's the issue that we had with the deputy executive director, we didn't have that position, so that's why it took longer. So I'm just wondering is that position established.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: I believe, Daniel, you said that was one that was established so it won't take as long but using that -- what the terms, what the codes were.

DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Actually, for the data analyst
that is a position that it's contemplated at an
interagency agreement at this time if we do it. So we
wouldn't need to have that position. If we couldn't do
the IIA, then of course we would try to go out on a
contract. Because that's going to be a very specialized
position, it's going to have a very short period of time
that they'll be working for us.

The data manager position, on the other hand if we
hire our own we do have that position established, but
it's in the way that we have the position itself
established. Raul right now is going through the process
of then getting us an additional slot for it. So we're
expanding the number of SSM1s that we have. Once you
have the basic position established, it's much easier to
then expand and just get a new slot for one, and that's
where we're at for it.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then, how about
you also mentioned for option 2 you would need an
engineer, so that one we wouldn't -- that's the one we'd
need to establish?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Well, under option 2 would be
USDR that's actually going to hire both the product
manager and engineer. No, wait, wait, wait.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: It's flipped.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Did I get the wrong one?
COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah, yeah, option 1 is where USDR does the heavy lifting in the front end and then we take on data analyst.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Right. So but Commissioner Fernandez you were speaking of the product manager, the new hire, the new position that wasn't previously discussed.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Right. Was that option 2 with the product manager and the engineer?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: USDR.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay, that's where I'm getting confused.

So you mentioned -- Commissioner Ahmad, you mentioned that USDR is eager to help. So we have assurances that they'll be there for the long haul and also do we need to contract with them and how long would that take?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah, good questions. So one, we can have theoretically the organization for the long haul, but we might not have the same face for the long haul. However, the way that they have divided it up in their options, with option 1 being that they build out the data collection tool from, you know, from a project manager managing it from end to end, and an engineer actually building it out. They think, they have said and
I can quote them, we go -- we run at this -- what is it, that we run at the --

COMMISSIONER TURNER: As the speed of need.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: -- speed of need. So we pushed them and they were like, "We run at the speed of need".

So if you have a reasonable deadline, we will get it done.

So in terms of their relationship being in the long run, from what I understood was that they would do that heavy lifting in the front end and then give us the tool so that our data manager and data analyst can pick up and move it forward.

We did have a conversation, this is like ancillary, but related, if the tool breaks, if there is some kind of a glitch in the system, if, you know, a weekend goes by and people are unable to input their information that would be all bad. So they said they would be able to help, but they might not be just as readily available.

So that is a skill or at least a perspective that we would want any internal staff to have is to be able to continuously do quality checks, whether that be through submissions like test inputs on a daily basis, or a weekly basis just to make sure that it's actually flowing through, whatever flow we establish.

And then, your second question was something and I
totally forgot it.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: You're expecting me to remember my own questions? Let me think. Oh, hold on.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Oh, contracting. Contracting.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, thank you.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: They are a volunteer-based organization. They do everything for free. But for our purposes, they are also willing and I think they have signed contracts with other government agencies, just so that there's a clear understanding of roles among both parties. So I would -- you know, I wouldn't bring anyone on without a contract, just to make sure that, you know, everything's clear and the I's are dotted and the T's are crossed kind of thing. But there's no cost associated with it, so that's nice.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Thank you, Commissioner Kennedy.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Yee.

COMMISSIONER YEE: Thank you Commissioners Turner and Ahmad. I love how you're helping us push into this new area of work with the Commission, which is taking us beyond what the 2010 Commission did.

A comment and a question. A comment is that I just want to remind ourselves that, you know, as community
input comes in, you know some people may have a complete
kind of piling on mappable community of interests to
submit, but a lot of people won't. They'll just have a
verbal description and it may involve even just one what
would be a line, you know one side of a polygon, which is
what they really care about. They don't really care
about the other sides.

So I know there is -- it seemed to me that in your
flow chart there is provision for that.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

COMMISSIONER YEE: But I just wanted to lift that up
and remind us that kind of input may actually be a large
part, or even the greater part of the inputs that we get.

A question, just cost. So option 1, option 2, USDR
being volunteer, how much of the consideration is cost?
And perhaps, Director Claypool, maybe you can help us
weigh how much to think about the two options in terms of
costs.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: I'd like to say to the first,
to your comment, yes, absolutely that was taken in
consideration. If people indeed only have opportunity to
draw one side of their diagram, or just all of the
qualitative words, verbiage, the tool will capture that.

Consideration of cost, Director Claypool I saw your
hand you wanted to weigh in on that?
DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Certainly. The first consideration for cost is how the subcommittee has dramatically decreased the cost over what our original estimate was. So this is, yeah, this was a very, very successful venture in bringing us to a better solution.

Cost, so we would have -- if we hire our own data manager, then we would have about a ten-month cost at an SSM1 level. And then, we would have whatever temporary staff came aboard, and they would come aboard on interagency agreements at 9,500 -- well, at $9,999 limits. So it's hard to tell. We can definitely factor the SSM1 in because we know that number. The rest of it will really depend on volume.

On the other end, it's also hard to tell what a data analyst will cost us on an interagency agreement. We'll have to put that out and just see what people bid.

And then, the product manager, as Commissioner Ahmad has said, that would come from USDR and presumably at no cost. And I would be quite honest, if there were some cost, it would be well worth paying for that expertise to have it -- to have them follow us. But I am of the same mindset that they seemed to indicate that they would do it at no cost.

So saying that, you know again, the actual costs will be very, very low compared to our original estimate.
And when I say very, very low, I think we're talking about in the hundreds of thousands, instead of in the $2 million range that I originally thought of. So that's about what the costs look like to me at this point.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Thank you. I see you, Commissioner Kennedy. I wanted to also just name, in the phrasing you said how much is cost consideration. I wanted to say that for the expertise, the commitment, experience and knowledge that USDR provide, I think in addition to there being a huge cost savings I'm convinced that this is the right team that will be able to bring the type of product that we need for the data management and analysis, the tool. On any of the sessions that we've met with, in addition to our team here, and some of the other subcommittees they've had no less than three of four people that's leaned in, trying to help us work this through.

So it's not just a cost savings. I think they're also the right individuals that are committed to bringing what we need for this Commission.

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you. Just wanted to check and see do we have enough information at this point to be able to estimate hardware costs? Because this is not just software development and staffing, we are going
to have some hardware costs for maintaining all of this. And I don't know where we are as far as estimating those.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Uh-hum, yeah, we have.

Commissioner Fornaciari, were you raising your hand for that. Oh, okay, Commissioner (sic) Claypool. We, I think, looked into some of the hardware costs.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: And I think -- I think theoretically, like I would like it if everything lived on the cloud. So hopefully, there's not much associated with, you know, saving files or backing up. But, yeah, so I don't know how that changes the cost estimate based off of that feature.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: I see you, Commissioner Fornaciari.

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Well, the platform that they're looking at using is the data's hosted on their end. So the data would be hosted there, all the hardware would be there. We'd pay a monthly fee for access to the platform and that's the business model.

So you know, one advantage of the tool that we're likely looking at is we don't have to buy servers, we don't have to set up servers, we don't have to manage servers, we don't have to maintain servers. It's all done by the host of the database.

And just with regard to Commissioner Yee's question,
I mean, so correct me if I'm wrong, but the way I understand it there's two options, right. One, USDR builds the system for us and we hire an analyst.

Option 2, we hire an engineer, we hire a product manager, they build it, and then we still have an analyst and we still have a data manager. So the difference in cost between the two options is USDR will build this thing for free or we hire people to build it for us. And so it's probably significantly higher if we're obviously hiring engineers and project managers ourselves.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you. I really appreciate all the different angles that people are coming at this issue from. I'm more of a process and how are we getting it all done. And I appreciate the admin and the whole different perspectives of it.

And in that part, I'm trying to make sure that I'm understanding our terminology of what is -- what do we mean by a project manager and a data analyst? Because I'm thinking, okay, we need your tech person in there who's going to be -- who will be running, you know, doing all the hardware. You know, not the hardware, but basically doing all the troubleshooting of this is working, that's not working. We need that person.

Then we also have people who are just entering data
into it. And then, I'm guessing the manager is the person who's kind of just the go-between? I'm not quite sure what these titles mean, if you could please walk through that.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: So your data manager is going to be managing those that are doing the input. So we will have a team of individuals that may come from different colleges. We haven't determined who's going to actually be doing the input. But your data manager is going to be both managing them and managing the input of the information.

When you talked about the tech person, as far as your project manager they're going to be ensuring the flow, the continuous flow, troubleshooting, doing the day-to-day checking of the project to ensure that the product is working fine.

And you have a data analyst that's actually going to take the information that has been input and being able then to massage it, answer questions, and inform us what the data is actually telling us.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. Yeah, just again to clarify. So you're saying the manager is -- okay, I'm trying to walk through. A document comes in, who decides where that is going? That's the project manager's?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Can I take a stab at this?
COMMISSIONER TURNER:  Yes.
COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN:  Yeah, sorry.
COMMISSIONER AHMAD:  Sorry, this is so Silicon Valley of me but a product -- a product manager would be managing the actual product. So the tool that we actually use to collect the data. So another example of a product, for example Google Docs, that's a product.
COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN:  That's a tech person, then?
COMMISSIONER AHMAD:  Right. So a product manager would walk that product through the line of development, so that person would be responsible of essentially carrying that product from an idea to an actual tool.

   So in our case a product manager would be responsible for listening to our input of what we want our tool to include. We want our tool to have like audio capability, and video capability. I'm just making this up. You know, we need to be able to travel to Mars and back in one day using our product. They would take all of that information and then work with the engineer to develop the actual product.

USDR is proposing that they would take on that role.
COMMISSIONER TURNER:  Right.
COMMISSIONER AHMAD:  And they would take on the engineering role. And then once that product is finished, and they have a Google Docs finished for us,
per se, they would hand it to us and be like here you go, use this for your data collection.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay, right.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Once it's in CRC, we would have a data manager, managing the data aspect of our organization.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Got it.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: So they would manage the data input, interns or contractors, they would oversee the data analyst's role. They would play, you know, like in any organization, the advocate role for the data management team. If there's any issues they would be working with Dan, with the rest of the team to essentially say, hey, this is how our functioning is going on a day-to-day. I hope that helps clarify it.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes. Okay, and then the analyst is the person who -- okay, so basically -- right, so we're saying essentially like option 1, which there kind of is the U.S. -- oh, shoot, you know, USDR is the project manager, essentially. They're helping us and going, okay, what are we trying to do with this. They're the person who's going to actually work with this is what the line drawer's doing, their ability, this is what the statewide can do, and this is the product you guys need.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Uh-hum.
COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And then, we're hiring a project manager, who will then go, okay, so here's the stuff that's coming in. It is -- oh, that's already a drawing, it will be handed -- and the line drawer is going to handle that part going forward. Here is, okay, wow, that's going to need translation, and shifts it that -- the project manager's essentially the sorter.

And then, we go down to and it's talking to, oh, okay, we need this, everything's still flowing along.

And then, the analyst is that the right category, is the person who's actually the tech person who's making sure that, yeah, this is all running, the process is going smoothly and you know, I need you to type in this, that kind of stuff. Is that the process we have, so the role?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: The analyst would be able to answer questions like how many -- how many people commented from Redding, California. And then, they would go through the database and be able to call that, query that information forward. Or if we stratify or separate the state into different parts, like we want to make sure we focus on the northern part, and we want to make sure we focus on heavily populated areas and see how many people submitted comments through our tools through that manner. The analyst would be able to pull that information out for us. They would also be able to pull
out information such as identical comments. For example, if there's an advocacy group out there that's saying, hey everyone, go populate this COI tool with this information, the analyst would be able to say, hey, you got fifty identical comments from Fresno, California. This is what they said. So that's the role of the analyst.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: The project manager or data manager, which is the same role in our eyes, is the people manager. So there needs to be a person who's managing the people.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: The process of the flow from the data -- from data from Californians back to Californians, that whole cyclical cycle -- that was redundant, cyclical cycle. But that whole process is something that the engineer would build out with our recommendations of what that protocol should look like. So if it's an automated process, how that data flows through the process.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: If it's a written comment, we would decide like how are we going to make sure that this comes back to our database so we can retrieve it for
deliberations at a later point.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: They would work at our
discretion to be able to, you know, build out that tool.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. So essentially you're
saying USDR, who is doing the tool, et cetera, is
essentially handing this baby off to the analyst who is
doing the real work on the technical work. And the data
manager is more of the people. Right, because that's --
you know, when you keep on saying these things I'm going
those tasks are the same -- it's the same task and you're
saying it's -- and in terms of how it's really going to
work out, yeah, I'm kind of wondering where the line is.
I'm thinking we're not quite -- the categories are a
little different in terms of reality.

And that could be because I'm also -- I understand
exactly what's written in the line drawer's RFP and what
the line drawer is thinking. So I would really love to
work with both of you on this to kind of flesh out some
ideas, which in terms of we've already kind of walked
through quite a bit of it.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Uh-hum.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And in terms of this is
where these pieces can fit together. If I may, I would
love to do it.
COMMISSIONER AHMAD: No, definitely Commissioner Turner and I had many questions that came up regarding the line drawer's role and how that fits into that diagram, which is why I should have put a question mark there. I wasn't sure, is the line drawer using their own tool? Is the line drawer using the COI tool?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yeah, I know.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: What Commissioner Kennedy brought up about the purpose of the two separate databases. Do we need two separate databases? Is there a way to combine them? All questions, valid questions and I have them, too. I don't have the answers to those, yet, but those questions are there.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: If I may, I'd love to help out with this in terms of fleshing this and moving this forward just for consistency's sake.

But then, I do have questions about which I think are more general is what -- we're looking out for the public. And then, the biggies are, which the whole Commissioner I think should be answering is how do we want to use this material and what do we want out of it? Because that's the bottom line that that criteria is absolutely necessary to build and to do any of the categories. The minutiae of it, which you can get really caught up into, which this is -- obviously, it's not more
than minutiae, but it is all the details of it. We need to know what do we want -- what are we trying to do with it at the end?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Andersen, what do we want to do with this specific diagram?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: No. No, no.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: What do we want to do with --

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: The information that comes out of it. What information do we want out and what are we doing with that? Are we using that to compare just different districts, different drawings? That's what we need to think about to put the proper -- essentially, to be able to give the information to USDR. Yeah, USDR in terms of what we're asking. What are our categories and why?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Well, yeah, that's not on this chart. We definitely will. That's what I think in our timeline there will be a time that we will be able, as they're creating the actual, be it Airtable or Tableau, there will be a time period where we'll have to determine what will we -- you know, what is it about. Do we need a space for lakes, a space for train tracks, a space for -- you know, all of that still has to be created.

The tool that we're walking through here basically assumes that the engineer that's creating it will be part
of doing -- you know, determining based even on what was
collected from 2010, based on what we're saying we need
now. Yeah, so that information still needs to be
determined. There's not a list or a chart that we have
right now that would say this is the type of things we're
going to collect. It just will be based on as testimony
starts to come in as well.

Commissioner Taylor?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Okay, Commissioners, we have to be
mindful of time. If this has to expand very much more,
we'd have to agendize it on another day.

Commissioner Sadhwani?

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Thanks Chair, I'll be brief.
First of all thank you. This is incredible and you've
put so much work in it, so a big thanks to both
Commissioner Ahmad and Commissioner Turner.

You know, my thoughts on this is that yes,
absolutely whoever we all -- however we develop this
system, and whoever we hire in these positions will
absolutely need to work really closely with the line
drawer.

And you know, I think are there additional questions
that we as Commissioners should answer? Probably, maybe
a few. But I think one of the great things is
identify -- what you have already done.
COMMISSIONER TURNER: Social studies?

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Excuse me?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Oh, I think I was telling my
grandbaby to go to social studies.

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Oh, sorry.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Sorry, I thought I was on
mute.

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: I was like, oh, I could
teach social studies.

You know, what was saying. Oh, I think one of the
things that I find so helpful about this, though, is that
in the next week or so Commissioner Andersen are going to
be thinking about like the scoring, and all of the things
that will go into the evaluation of the line drawer
applicants that we receive. And I think this is super
helpful because ultimately, rather than us kind of
answering all of -- trying to figure out all of these
specifics, I think when we have a line drawer on board,
as well as I think it will help inform the data
management process even more. And just is that clear
reminder that we're really going to need folks that can
work very collaboratively and closely together.

And so my only question was, I may have missed it,
what was the timeline? I know Commissioner Turner, you
were just talking about timeline. What was that timeline
in terms of beginning to build some of this out and advance this, just so that we can coordinate that appropriately?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Turner, briefly do you have a reply?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: I do not. Not briefly, I have to find it. Sorry.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Ahmad, do you have a reply as to timeline?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: I guess in terms of timeline of building out a tool, if we were to go with USDR, would hopefully be like a month and a half.

In terms of our ask today was the two pieces that we were actually sure of, which is an internal data manager and an internal data analyst. Whether we move forward with a partnership with USDR or not, we would have to either hire additional staff or we don't need to hire those additional staff.

So I think that's what we're looking for today from you all is whether we have the Commission's support to move on with those hirings or the recruitment, starting the recruitment process for those hirings. I will work with Dan and Commissioner Turner to figure out the timeline and then, hopefully, we can get something more in terms of potential contract language, or et cetera,
for everyone's reaction by the next meeting. I don't
want to make any promises, though.

CHAIR TAYLOR: So Commissioner Ahmad and
Commissioner Turner, are you looking for sort of a
leaning or do you want a formal vote?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: It would be great if we can
have a formal vote, if people feel they have enough
information.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, I was at that point
where I wanted to know how to voice my motion. So I want
to make sure I get it right. Because Commissioner Ahmad,
you mentioned moving forward with the data analyst and
data manager, correct? And then, also working with USDR
to build that for us, correct? Is that the -- did I get
the right language?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, and I would think that it would
be in support of option number 1.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, is that -- is that
correct?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes, but we didn't write it on
that document. Is that something that we should be
holding off on or is it safe from a legal stand point to
still take action on such an item?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Well, because you -- I
think you agendized it with potential action, correct?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Okay. Okay, so our --

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Action.

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Got it, okay.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: So would my -- and correct me if I'm wrong, would my motion be in support of option 1, which includes the data analyst and data manager? Is that right?

CHAIR TAYLOR: I would think that you can state in support of option number 1.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay then, there it is.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I love this conversation, but I believe we already did this. Didn't we already vote and for to move forward with proceeding, that the subcommittee would proceed writing an RFI, given -- I know they've gotten more in formation and it's a modification, but I believe that coming back this is more of a clarification as opposed to requiring a vote or I could be --

COMMISSIONER TURNER: No, you're absolutely right Commissioner Andersen, there was a previous vote. Just so much has changed since then though, which is why we're coming back now. And it really looks a lot different than the initial approval received.
COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. All right, thank you for that clarification.

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: I'll second.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. And it's seconded by Commissioner Fornaciari.

Any further discussion regarding this issue?

Before we move to public comment regarding a vote, we also have to revisit Deputy Executive Director Hernandez's amendment to the Outreach Plan, so that we would be able to take public comment, right, regarding those votes all they want.

The floor is yours, Deputy.

DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: Yes, so thank you very much. I've gone back and I've made some edits to the areas that were addressed. On page 8, under phase 2, Educational Outreach, I've added a paragraph at the end. And I can share my screen here real quick so that you can take a look at that. Hopefully, you can see that there. "Staff and/or Commissioners will communicate to the community-based organizations when scheduling an educational presentation, but the presentation is for educational purposes only, and that the Commission will not take public comment during this meeting. Commissioners will also mention that they are providing information for educational purposes and not taking public input at the
beginning of the presentation and at the beginning of the
question and answer part of the presentation. Staff
and/or Commissioners will provide the community
organizations information on how to get to the tools for
public input."

So that was the first thing that was added.

Secondly, on page 8, under phrase -- phase 3, just
changed the date, "Scheduled to begin in April".

Likewise on page 9, clarified the text a little bit.

"Public input the COI input are scheduled to begin in
April and we'll include the line drawer at those
meetings."

So those are some of the minor changes. The last
change on the page 7, I removed the reference to
"Citizens" and we are now using Californians throughout
the document.

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you. If you could go
up so that we can see on the page 8, could you please
take the line: "During this phase the Commission will
receive the Census data to work with" and move that to
the end. Because that way we don't want them to think --
because the way it reads right now, it appears that, oh,
the Census data and then again, in their minds, so and
that's what we're starting with.
And so it's more consistent, public meetings would begin in April, more details schedule during this phase. Because then it says -- it doesn't say at the beginning, it's during this phase -- yeah, that just reads much more with what's really going to go on. Thank you.

DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: Very well.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: I'm actually not seeing the screen, so if anyone else has any comments, so I'm going to stop sharing for a second.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez and then Commissioner Yee.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I just -- did you need a motion?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, I'll make a motion to accept this fluid document, how's that.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Conceptual.

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, conceptual.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Andersen, do you second?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I second.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Yee?

COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes, on item 1 there, "Will not accept public comment", can we insert "on redistricting matters" so it's more clear what isn't being accepted. I
mean I wouldn't want anyone to think they can't say anything, right. So let's keep it to the language that's actually in our rules.

   DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: Very well, I'll -- so I think we have to amend the motion for --

   CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, do you accept Commissioner Yee's suggestion, the motion as amended by Commissioner Yee?

   COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And the second also as amended.

   CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any further discussion?

   Katy, can you invite in public comment regarding the Outreach Plan, agenda item 6, and the Data Management Option number 1, agenda item number 16.

   PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Chair.

   CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

   PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize transparency and public participation in our process, the Commissioners will be taking public comment by phone. To call in dial the telephone number provided on the live stream feed. It is 877-853-5247. When promoted to enter the meeting ID number that is provided on the live stream feed, it is 976-7934-9222, for this week's meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply press the pound key.
Once you have dialed in, you'll be placed in a queue. To indicate you wish to comment, please press star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator. When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic message that says the host would like you to talk and to press star 6 to speak. If you would like to give your name, please state and spell it for the record. You are not required to provide your name to give public comment.

Please make sure to mute your computer or live stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during your call.

Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when it is your turn to speak and again, please turn down the live stream volume.

The Commission is taking public comment at this time on agenda item 6, option 1, and agenda item 16. And we do not have any callers with their hand up.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll give it a minute -- we'll give it a few minutes for a pause.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay.

(Pause)

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Chair, I just wanted to acknowledge all the great work Katy's done today.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.
CHAIR TAYLOR: It goes. I can't say enough. Thank you, Katy, thank you Knute (phonetic), thank you. We worked Jesse, too. Thank you, we appreciate it.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yeah, thank you so much.

CHAIR TAYLOR: We're almost there Commissioners, we're working the problem.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yeah, the instructions are completed on the stream, Chair.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We do have two callers in the queue and I --

CHAIR TAYLOR: All right.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We do have two callers in the queue, but they -- you can press star 9.

CHAIR TAYLOR: They don't have their hand raised.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: No.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Okay, can you just give the hand-raising instruction one more time? If not, then we'll proceed.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. If you have called in and you are waiting in the queue, if you could press star 9 to indicate you would like to share? Nope, not right now.

CHAIR TAYLOR: All right, thank you.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Uh-hum.
CHAIR TAYLOR: Ms. Sheffield, can you move -- can we move to a -- can you call the roll for a vote regarding agenda item number 6 in concept, the Outreach Plan, by Deputy Executive Director Hernandez?

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo?

VICE CHAIR TOLEDO: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Vazquez?

COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Yee?

COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes. Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons?

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sadhwani?

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sinay?

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: And Commissioner Taylor?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Motion passes.

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: You're muted.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Ms. Sheffield, can you call the roll for the vote on agenda item number 16, option 1 for the data management?

COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: You're muted.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo?

VICE CHAIR TOLEDO: Yes. Sorry.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Vazquez?

COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Abstain.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Yee?

COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes.
MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

Commissioner Le Mons?

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: That was a yes from me. I was having problems unmuting. Sorry.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Got it.

Commissioner Sadhwani?

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sinay?

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: And Commissioner Taylor?

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

MS. SHEFFIELD: All right, the motion passes.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Good work for everyone on their respective committees.

Quickly, we want to address any future meeting dates and agenda items. When we left last, we had all of the February meeting dates intact. Our first subtraction was the March 3rd date, I believe.

Do we have any other differences or additions?

Quickly, how can we address our meeting dates?
Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay, I propose in March we've already dropped the 3rd, we do not want -- we'd rather not go to a three-day. So leave 8 and 9 as is and either try a workshop on Saturday the 13th, say for the new line drawer, just to kind of -- it would be probably a half day. And then, possibly another on the -- oh, that's right before Easter. On the Saturday, the 27th, possibly a workshop VRA training, or maybe a little something like that. Again, that would probably be a half day. Or a day on the weekend.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay?

COMMISSIONER SINAY: What I'm seeing on our calendar that the February 13th is President's Day weekend, so that means it's a long weekend. I know none of us are traveling but --

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay, did you mean March 13th? Our February --

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Again, I messed up. Sorry.

CHAIR TAYLOR: No problem. The February calendar remains intact.

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yeah, sorry.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sadhwani then Commissioner Le Mons.

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: You know, while I certainly
share Commissioner Andersen's desire to do workshops for the line drawer and VRA, I think given the news that the Census data is most certainly going to be delayed, and also knowing that February is going to be an extraordinarily busy month, particularly for the Legal Affairs Committee, who will meeting numerous additional days beyond our business meetings, I would like for the Commission to consider holding off on those workshops until April. I don't think that there is any problem for us to wait.

And then, if it's on a Saturday, that sounds fine with me. I know we talked about just changing it up so that it's not always on the days. But I think that way it can lighten our load a little in March and give us just a little bit more breathing room because we do have that flexibility.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

Commissioner Le Mons.

COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I echo Commissioner Sadhwani's comments.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any other questions or comments from Commissioners?

Commissioner Andersen?

COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I agree with that and I would actually almost even tend to propose that we might
do a combo type thing on Saturday, April 10, which is
after Easter, the week after Easter.

CHAIR TAYLOR: So what I would -- yes, what I would
propose is that especially given what we might have on
the outreach calendar that we will come back at our next
meeting and we can address perhaps going that far out to
April. Does that sound acceptable to Commissioners?

All right. We brought in Mariano Rivera to get a
save here.

COMMISSIONER SINAY: I wonder if we --

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay?

COMMISSIONER SINAY: Oh, I'm sorry, I didn't realize
I was unmuted this whole time. Do we still need the
March 29th and April 1st meeting, since we're looking at
further out of April? I mean, I know we're all kind of
breathing a little bit more air right now.

CHAIR TAYLOR: I would think that would be addressed
on our February 8th meeting. Thank you.

All right. So then I would like to invite in public
comment to conclude this meeting. Katy, can you invite
in the public, please?

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, I can.

In order to maximize transparency and public
participation in our process, the Commissioners will be
taking public comment by phone. To call in, dial the
telephone number provided on the live stream feed. It is 877-853-5247. When prompted to enter the meeting ID number that is provided on the live stream feed, it is 976-7934-9222 for this week's meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply press the pound key.

Once you have dialed in, you'll be placed in a queue. To indicate you wish to comment, please press star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator. When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic message that says the host would like you to talk, and to press star 6 to speak. If you would like to give your name, please state and spell it for the record. You are not required to provide your name to give public comment.

Please make sure to mute your computer or live stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during your call. Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when it is your turn to speak and please, again, turn down the live stream volume.

The Commission is taking general public comment to close this week's meeting.

And we do not currently have anybody knew in the queue. And if anybody who is in the queue would like to speak, please press star 9 to raise your hand.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll give it pause.

(Pause)
PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And we do have a caller.

CHAIR TAYLOR: I think we have a caller, thank you.

PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And the floor is yours.

If you would like to share your name, please state and spell it for the record. Otherwise, share your comment.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Yes, this is Renee Westa-Lusk again, and I just had a question regarding the, I guess, the flow chart. The flow chart for the --

CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, go ahead.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: -- data management system.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Ms. Westa-Lusk, please go ahead.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay. Yeah, I'm trying to mute my computer. The question I have about the flow chart is I see two kinds of data coming into the CRC. One's the electronic, I would call it electronic, the COI tool data. And then, you have hardcopy, or maybe physical letters, and I guess there is a little box that says public testimony or something like that, where there's meeting notes and verbal testimony, and then emails, and then hand-drawn maps.

My only question is are both kinds of data going to be treated equally the same? Because I only see line drawing for the non-COI tool. And is it assumed that because the COI tool, is that partly considered as an automatic line drawer, so therefore, there's no line
drawing listed on that flow data chart? Whereas on
the -- I'm looking at it. On the right side it says line
drawers, arrow from the side where it's non-COI tool
files.

I guess I'm worried about equal treatment of data.
I would assume you'd still need some kind of line
drawing, even with the COI tool data that you'll be
receiving. I guess that's my main question.

And then, I have a security issue with all the data.
I assume that's going to be taken care of at a later
discussion, or the Cyber Security Subcommittee takes care
of that. I guess I'm worried about data that could be
not just hacked into, but erased from the system. And I
wanted to know will the data management people be
addressing security or is that someone else's
responsibility. Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Turner, I saw you
briefly unmuted yourself. Was that to provide a
response?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes, I wanted to just -- uh-
hum, I wanted to thank the caller and for the first part
of your question where you are referencing the blue box,
it spoke to the emails, written comments, the non-COI
tool data, it is treated with equal concern and
importance. It's just a matter of process. Because it
is non-COI tool data, it will go and come directly into the Commissioner's first.

   And then, if you notice the line that goes down to a data management team, which will process it and ensure that that information is sent back through the captcha, which part of our -- one part of the security piece. And then, down into the COI tool for the line drawing for it to be processed through the COI tool that will go into the main database.

   Your second part of the question had to do with, I think, security. And for that, we have worked with our data security people throughout the process to ensure that it is a secure system. I don't know if, Commissioner Fornaciari, you want to say anything additional to that, or if there was something else I left out.

   CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fornaciari?

   COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yeah, I want to just -- yeah, the cyber security team is in on the meetings with the data management team, you know, providing that perspective, too. So we're closely engaged with the process.

   MS. WESTA-LUSK: I guess one other feedback to your responses, will there be more than one backup system? Because I'm always worried, especially about California.
It seems like California, as a state, the people here experience more identity theft, hacking, stealing of information than I think over states do. And I don't know exactly why. But I guess I'm worried that just one backup system, if something should get erased or someone gets in there and just deletes whole files, is there going to be something like that where you have more than one backup system for all the data that's inputted either through the non-COI tool files or the COI tool files?

COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Well, you know, we haven't resolved all those details yet, but we're working on it. And I do appreciate your input and that thought, and that's something we'll definitely take into consideration as we kind of work through our cyber security approach. So thank you for bringing that thought up. Appreciate that.

MS. WESTA-LUSK: Thank you.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you for your comments, it's always extremely helpful. Thank you, Ms. Westa-Lusk.

Director Claypool?

DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Before you leave, Ms. Westa-Lusk, would you please send me your email information to my email address? It is Daniel.claypool@crc.ca.gov. We want to make sure that we provide you with a way to upload your information. And so again that is
Daniel.claypool@crc.ca.gov. Thank you very much.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

All right, Commissioners, with that we'll close public comment.

Commissioner Kennedy?

COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Just I thought we were going to close the session, but I just wanted to give a shout out to our counterparts in the Michigan Commission, who are meeting as we speak.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any other statements or comments from Commissioners?

I would like to remind those following Commissioners, those watching, that the Legal Affairs Committee will begin their meeting in approximately an hour. What do you say, Commissioner Sadhwani --

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: 2:15.

CHAIR TAYLOR: -- Chair Sadhwani for that -- 2:15?

MS. MANOFF: No, it's going to start in 15 minutes.

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: I believe we'll need to take a one-hour lunch break for all of the staff.

CHAIR TAYLOR: For staff.

COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Correct. So we will have to push the start time to 2:15, yes.

CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Thank you, guys. Thank you, everyone. Thank you.
COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR TAYLOR: No problem. I know I have shared space. Thank you. See you guys on February 8th.

February 8th. All righty, thank you.

(Whereupon, the CRC Business Meeting adjourned at 1:16 p.m.)
CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPTOR

I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript, to the best of my ability, of the videoconference recording of the proceedings provided by the California Citizens Redistricting Commission.

LORI RAHTES, CDLT-108

June 23, 2022