TE TAURA WHIRI
I TE REO MĀORI

MĀORI LANGUAGE COMMISSION

Toi Reo Māori
Programme Evaluation
2021/22

June 2022

Prepared by R&K
Consultants Limited

Contents

He mihi

Connect it, bind it,

Seek it, grasp it,

This is where night and day converge as one.

My ears listen intently

Chasing the sounds

Tis I who bring understanding

So that all can hear.

Let my fingers be adept

To the words that are etched

Tis I who bring understanding

So that all can see.

Fasten it, secure it,

Let me affirm myself ready to depart,

To take my stand above, to the highest height,

be permanent, be adept, Te Toi Reo Māori!

And so the guardian of the Māori language, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori, I acknowledge you. You have given effect to the status of the Māori Language Act, tending to and protecting those who have been sanctioned as translators and interpreters for our language, their craft, as well as the language they are translating. I acknowledge you.

I acknowledge all of you who have contributed to this report, to evaluate Toi Reo Māori. So many of its qualities were dissected, debated and discussed in these last months. The collation here is a gathering of all those topics in the one place for you to peruse, to strengthen even more the prestige of Toi Reo Māori as a treasure for this nation, and for Māoridom.

I acknowledge you our greatest treasures who are no longer with us, I farewell you. We grieve still for you and for your voices who will no longer be heard, nor be etched into paper. Rangi, Lee, to you all, may you rest in eternal peace.

And so it is us, those left behind here, in the world of the living. I acknowledge us all who strive for excellence in translation, and in Toi Reo Māori.

Let it be!

Executive summary

Toi Reo Māori programme

The Toi Reo Māori programme is the only recognised te reo Māori translators and interpreters' qualification available in Aotearoa. It sits outside any formal qualification framework (such as the New Zealand Qualifications Authority). Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori administers Toi Reo Māori under Te Ture mō Te Reo Māori 2016, giving it authority to license qualified translators and interpreters.

The widespread use of te reo Māori in society today has increased the demand[1] for, and supply of, high quality te reo Māori translation and interpretation services. This demand has led to an increased number of people sitting Toi Reo Māori. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori is committed to increasing the number of certified translators and interpreters who are industry-ready and well supported through professional development opportunities. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori has recognised that the Toi Reo Māori programme is not of an international standard and requires ongoing investment to raise the standard and bring it in line with other international certification programmes.

Moving programme to an online setting

With the growing need for certified translators and interpreters and the impact of COVID-19, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori wants to move delivery of the Toi Reo Māori programme to an online platform. COVID-19 restrictions over the past two years have advanced the need to explore online delivery options for Toi Reo Māori to ensure business continuity.

Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori signalled its strong preference to move the programme to a digital platform and has used the past two Toi Reo Māori cohorts to test and review online delivery options to inform future infrastructure, technological and programme changes.

Programme evaluation

In November 2021, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori engaged R&K Consultants Ltd to undertake an evaluation of the Toi Reo Māori programme as they prepare to move the programme to an online platform.

This evaluation examines what activities or approaches have and have not been effective for the Toi Reo Māori programme. It also looks at what changes need to be made to improve the Toi Reo Māori programme for it to be successful online in the future.

1. Anecdotal evidence from public sector agencies and local councils show that translation services are in high demand. The required translation services are both internal and external facing.

What works well

The evaluation found that the following areas work well within the Toi Reo Māori programme:

› Programme resources are sufficient to manage one cohort per annum.

› There is a good balance of old and new expertise and knowledge within the current teaching team.

› Marketing and promotion of Toi Reo Māori is effective and reaches a wide audience both within and outside of Aotearoa.

› The pre-entry test has been a successful enhancement to Toi Reo Māori.

› The current change in the examination weighting to 10 per cent reflects a more balanced approach and better aligns with the standards-based approach that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori is currently exploring.

› The content is thorough, and the different genres provide exposure to the different types of potential future work opportunities for candidates.

What does not work well

The evaluation found that the following areas are not working well within the Toi Reo Māori programme:

› The pre-entry process could be strengthened further to ensure that the expectations of Toi Reo Māori participants are clearly outlined. Better screening of candidates is required.

› More wānanga would be highly beneficial for candidates to revise learnings and spend more direct time with kaiako.

› Better curriculum planning is required to ensure the programme is delivering on the learning objectives.

› The marking system and processes need to be reviewed. There is inconsistency between what kaiako are teaching and the results coming back from the external markers.

› More learning resources (tools, templates, digital repositories, etc.) are required to support candidates on their learning pathway.

› Better understanding is needed of international industry standards for translation and interpretation services and how these can be applied to Toi Reo Māori.

› There is no centralised storage facility for learning and teaching documentation and resources.

Future design considerations

The evaluation identified areas for consideration for future enhancement of the programme:

› Cohort size: a cap of a maximum of approximately 20 students per kaiako, and ideally 15 per kaiako, (i.e. a total of a maximum of 60 for three kaiako) provides for optimum quality interactions and for managing the intense learning required through Toi Reo Māori.

› Statement of Performance Expectations: establishing robust systems to measure the performance targets for Toi Reo Māori. Presently it is difficult to ascertain the number of 'active' licensed translators and interpreters working in the industry.

› Pass mark: the current pass mark is set at 80 per cent. There are strong views that this should be lifted to 90 per cent.

› Standards-based assessment: moving to a standards-based framework provides a more balanced assessment approach and reflects current learning practices. It may also assist with reducing the high fail rate (approximately 33 per cent) of candidates in Toi Reo Māori by allowing candidates to re-sit standards or modules until they have achieved the credits.

› Ongoing support mechanisms: with no formal professional development pathways or mechanisms to support licensed translators and interpreters, the development of a professional programme for post-programme support should be explored. The programme could consider:

    › a recertification process for licensed translators and interpreters, say every five years, to ensure their practice and quality is sound

    › a 'finishing class' to target candidates who are within close reach of passing Toi Reo Māori but may need more guided experience and support.

› National association opportunity: there is a need to support a professional body or association to represent the interests of te reo Māori translators and interpreters. Te Kāhui Whakamāori has been marked to take on this role. This would include professional development, mentoring support, advocacy, and membership management services.

› Outsourcing training: further consideration is needed about whether Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori should just provide their legislative role of certifying successful candidates and leave the training of translators and interpreters to other specialised providers.

Enablers and limitations of online delivery

The evaluation noted several factors which enabled positive experiences during online delivery. These included candidates having a stable internet connection, a dedicated quiet space and a good level of technical capabilities to manage Zoom meetings and computer hardware issues such as audio or visual problems associated with online calls or viewing content on YouTube.

The evaluation also noted the following limitations with online delivery:

› some candidates are not technologically savvy

› poor internet connectivity, particularly for those candidates who live in rural locations

› loss of whanaungatanga and the opportunity for candidates to network and work collectively

› perceived loss of quality teaching experiences, since online classes can mask candidates understanding of content

› reduced protection of intellectual property of kaiako.

The likely transition to online delivery (of assessments and exams) also presents opportunities for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to use software such as translation memory software, digital assessment, remote proctoring, and e-marking tools to streamline administrative processes for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. An online solution should also provide safe and secure services to prevent deceptive behaviour, provide better online learning and assessment and a better user experience for candidates, kaiako and the programme staff.

▶ Recommended Improvements

The evaluation identified areas where the Toi Reo Māori programme could be improved as it moves to an online platform. The improvements are grouped under two key areas: programme design and policy development considerations.

Programme design improvements	
Programme resources	Employ a dedicated full-time kaiako to teach and mark assessments and exams.
Pre-entry test / registration	Develop a voluntary 'preliminary' pre-entry quiz which could be placed online with 'exemplar' answers. This preliminary test would allow potential candidates to self-assess to see if they are at an acceptable standard to complete the full Toi Reo Māori programme Redesign the pre-entry test so that results are automatically provided through electronic marking. Undertake additional screening and assessment of candidates. Provide an online wānanga to outline expectations.
Wānanga	Increase the number of wānanga on offer and/or extend the length of current wānanga.
Marking	Develop a marking policy and guidelines for Toi Reo Māori that match the content being taught. Employ a dedicated full-time kaiako to teach and mark assessments and exams.
Programme content	Develop dedicated resources that support the learning objectives and online sessions. Delineate unique content required for translators and those for interpreters. From an industry perspective, interpretation is treated as a distinct field whereas the Toi Reo Māori programme treats interpretation and translation as one. This tends to blend the programme content. Engage an experienced curriculum developer (or learning designer) to review the current curriculum and work with kaiako to confirm learning objectives, content, teaching strategies, sequence of learning activities, and the type and frequency of assessments. The curriculum developer could also confirm the technology required (such as using Google Hangouts, Canvas, Moodle or other) to support the online learning. Develop content that aligns to international translation and interpretation industry standards and their relationship to Toi Reo Māori. Develop a centralised storage facility for learning and teaching documentation. Develop programme resources (in collaboration with kaiako) based on curriculum plan. Provide more targeted content and context around international standards for translation and interpretation. Upskill kaiako so they have the necessary information to teach that subject area.

Policy development improvements	
Cohort size	Set a cap of approximately 20 students maximum (and ideally 15 students) per kaiako.
	Consider the option of holding more than one cohort per annum, subject to the availability of resources and time.
Statement of Performance Expectations (SPE) targets	Review the current State of Performance Expectations targets so they are able to be appropriately measured.
Pass mark	Revise the pass mark so it balances the requirement for achieving high quality candidates with increasing the number of licensed translators and interpreters.
Standards-based assessment	Develop suitable standards based on research evidence.
	Engage a content developer/planner to redesign learning modules and develop a structured curriculum plan.
Toi Reo Māori outcomes	Clearly define the purpose and intended target group for Toi Reo Māori. This may include developing separate streams for those looking at translation and interpretation as a future profession and another stream for others.
	Embed and widely socialise the programme goals through internal and external communications.
Support mechanisms	Develop a learning and development programme package including professional development opportunities, resources, networking opportunities and mentoring/peer support groups.
	Develop a recertification process after a set period to ensure candidates are continuing to maintain a high standard of practice and remain committed to the industry.
	Develop a 'finishing class' stream to support candidates who are close to passing but need more direct support to successfully complete Toi Reo Māori.
National association or representative body	Provide resources to build the capacity and capability of Te Kāhui Whakamāori as the professional association for te reo Māori translators and interpreters.
Technology	Develop or procure a learning management system (such as Canvas or Moodle) to support course management and administration of the programme.
	Investigate options to use translation memory software, digital assessment, remote proctoring (if required), and e-marking tools.
Outsourcing training	Explore the option of potentially outsourcing the training, while retaining the certification of translators and interpreters in-house.

▶ Conclusion

Online is a preferred method of delivery, with COVID-19 continuing to have a daily impact on businesses. With this in mind, future enhancements to Toi Reo Māori will need to balance the technological, cultural, and spiritual nuances of online versus in-person learning.

The establishment of a professional body and the delivery of a comprehensive learning and development programme are imperative to raising the standards of Toi Reo Māori in order to achieve an internationally recognised certification programme. Technology tools will also enhance the administration of the programme and the way candidates interact and engage in the Toi Reo Māori learning experience, both online and offline.

The widespread use of te reo Māori in communities, workplaces, homes, and learning environments provides immense opportunities for Toi Reo Māori to continue to contribute to the achievement of the overarching vision and goals of Te Whare o te Reo Mauriora, through the provision of quality te reo Māori translation and interpretation services.

Introduction

Toi Reo Māori Programme

1. The Toi Reo Māori programme is the only recognised te reo Māori translators and interpreters' qualification available in Aotearoa. It sits outside any formal qualification framework (such as the New Zealand Qualifications Authority). Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori administers Toi Reo Māori under Te Ture mō Te Reo Māori 2016, giving it authority to license qualified translators and interpreters.

2. The widespread use of te reo Māori in society today has increased the demand for, and supply of, high quality te reo Māori translation and interpretation services. This demand has led to an increased number of people sitting Toi Reo Māori. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori is committed to increasing the number of certified translators and interpreters who are industry-ready and well supported through professional development opportunities.

Evaluation of the Toi Reo Māori Programme

3. With the growing need for certified translators and interpreters and the impact of COVID-19, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori wants to move Toi Reo Māori to an online platform. In November 2021, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori engaged R&K Consultants Ltd to undertake an evaluation of Toi Reo Māori as they prepare to move the programme online.

4. The evaluation examines what activities or approaches have and have not been effective for Toi Reo Māori. It also looks at what changes need to be made to improve Toi Reo Māori for it to be successful online in the future.

5. The evaluation findings and recommendations also sought to assist Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to:
   › inform future planning, resourcing and policy development of the programme
   › increase the capability of translators and interpreters through ongoing learning and development opportunities
   › maintain the quality of licenced translators and interpreters.

Background

6. The Toi Reo Māori programme supports the outcomes of Maihi Karauna and the work of Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori by ensuring the quality of te reo Māori is maintained, and the public have access to qualified, quality te reo Māori translation and interpretation services.

7. The broader intention[2] of Toi Reo Māori is to increase the supply of licensed quality te reo Māori translators and interpreters across Aotearoa, so that the industry has sufficient capacity to manage demands.

8. As at February 2022, there were 213 individuals on the register of licensed translators and interpreters that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori manages. The number of individuals actively working in the industry is unknown, but is expected to be in the vicinity of 50[3] individuals.

Programme Resources

9. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori employs a full-time language service advisor to oversee the Toi Reo Māori programme, and a part-time administrator who supports the programme. Additionally, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori contracts:

› three kaiako (licensed translators and interpreters) to deliver the programme (content and tuition); and

› four markers[4] to assess the pre-entry and wānanga assessments and the final examinations.

Toi Reo Māori Examination

10. The current process for becoming a licensed translator or interpreter involves candidates registering online and completing a pre-entry assessment.[5] Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori assesses the pre-entry test, ensuring candidates are sufficiently proficient to proceed to the full programme.

11. Once entered, candidates complete:

› three two-day (over a weekend) online wānanga where they receive tuition and are required to complete assessments (30 per cent per wānanga, total 90 per cent)

› a final examination involving a written assessment for *translators* and/or an oral assessment for *interpreters* (10 per cent).

12. Candidates have a choice of sitting both or just one of the translator (written) and interpreter (oral) examinations. Upon successful completion of the exam, candidates are awarded one of the following:

› certificate of competency in interpreting the Māori language

› certificate of competency in translating the Māori language

› certificate of competency in interpreting and translating the Māori language.

2. Based on the intervention logic model confirmed 7 November 2021

3. [refer] Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori website

4. Markers are generally different people to the kaiako, however, recently, one of the kaiako has also undertaken the marking.

5. Comprising an English and te reo Māori passage to translate

Evaluation approach

13. The evaluation focuses on learning about and understanding the key factors that enable or inhibit the successful delivery of the Toi Reo Māori programme.

14. The evaluation aims to answer the following key questions:
    › How well is the Toi Reo Māori programme being implemented?
    › What activities or approaches have and have not worked for the programme?
    › What changes, if any, are required to improve the effectiveness of the programme?
    › What are the enablers for effective online delivery of the programme?
    › What are the limitations and/or risks of online delivery of the programme?

15. To answer these key questions, the evaluation team employed a broad approach to gather quantitative and qualitative information:
    a.) **desktop review** of key documentation.
    b.) **online survey** of participants who sat the programme over the past two years.
    c.) **interviews** with Toi Reo Māori candidates, and Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori.
    d.) **observation** of a wānanga on Zoom involving the cohort of the 2021/22 year.
    e.) development of a draft **intervention logic model**.

Desktop review

16. A review of key documents relating to the Toi Reo Māori programme was completed to clearly understand the intentions, activities, policies, intended outcomes and delivery approaches of the programme. This included (not an exhaustive list):
    › establishment papers of Toi Reo Māori (process workflows)
    › previous research reports
    › pre-entry test
    › website content
    › accountability documents, including the recent annual reports, statement of intent and statements of performance expectations.

Surveys

17. Two surveys were completed for this evaluation:

    a.) An *online survey* was developed in consultation with Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori in December 2021, targeted at the 130 participants (translators and interpreters) who completed Toi Reo Māori in the past two years.

    b.) A *right-shift measurement survey* was prepared for the cohort (translators and interpreters) who completed Toi Reo Māori in April 2022.

18. Once Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori approved the content and te reo Māori translation of the online survey, the survey link was emailed to the 130 participants. A total of 49 responses were received representing a response rate of 38 per cent (target rate was 60 per cent). Prizes were offered to participants as an incentive to complete the survey. The low survey response rate was supplemented with additional participant interviews.

19. Most online survey responses were completed in te reo Māori, although some responded in English.

20. The online survey captured data from participants about their diverse experiences (positive and negative) with the programme in the following focus areas:

    › quality of teaching and delivery mechanisms

    › effectiveness of each step in the process (pre-entry, registration, wānanga, examination, resourcing, follow-up)

    › attitudes towards online delivery versus wānanga-ā-tinana

    › ideas to enhance the programme, including making it successful and/or effective online.

21. The *right-shift measurement survey* captured data from participants of the 2021/22 cohort of Toi Reo Māori so that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori could understand the impact that Toi Reo Māori had on those participants' confidence in using te reo Māori. Unfortunately, data was only captured at the end of the programme, so questions were structured so that participants needed to recall their skill level both before the programme and after the programme.[6]

22. In future, the *right-shift measurement survey* will ask Toi Reo Māori participants the same questions at the start of the programme, and on completion, to ascertain the 'shift' or progress participants have made in their proficiency in te reo Māori as a result of having completed Toi Reo Māori.

6. An example of the question structure is 'Think about your skill level before, and after, Toi Reo Māori'. The typical answer where right-shifting occurred was the response 'Overall, I feel more equipped to translate Te Mātauranga now, compared to before I entered Toi Reo Māori'.

Interviews

23. The evaluation team completed one-on-one interviews with the following key people:

    › Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori including the Toihau, Te Tumu Whakahaere, Director Te Amo, Kaiārahi-Mahere Reo, team leader of Te Amo, Language Service Advisor and the team leader of Te Hāpai Ō

    › kaiako of Toi Reo Māori

    › 12 Toi Reo Māori programme participants (in te reo Māori).

24. Toi Reo Māori interview participants were selected based on the following criteria:

    › a selection of participants from the past four cohorts, which includes two cohorts that sat the online delivery and two cohorts that experienced the traditional face-to-face delivery

    › a mix of participants by age, gender, ethnicity (including non-Māori)

    › a mix of participants who achieved interpreters, translators and or both qualifications, as well as a selection of those who were unsuccessful or did not complete the programme

    › a selection of participants who are currently repeating the Toi Reo Māori examination or have sat the examination more than once.

25. Given the COVID-19 restrictions and safety measures, all interviews were undertaken by phone, Zoom or Microsoft Teams. The interviews used semi-structured topic guides based on the key evaluation questions. Interviewees were provided with an information sheet and interview consent form prior to being interviewed. Copies of these are attached in appendices one and two of this report. A detailed interview guide including the questions is provided in appendix three.

26. Interviews were conducted in te reo Māori and/or English depending on the preferred language of the interviewees.

Observation

27. The evaluation team observed one of the three wānanga of the 2021/22 cohort on Zoom. The purpose was to better understand how the programme ran, the engagement of candidates and the delivery of lessons. This observation was conducted in November 2021.

Toi Reo Māori Intervention logic

28. In consultation with Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori, the evaluation team drafted an intervention logic model to understand the underlying assumptions, inputs and activities that contribute to the achievement of the Toi Reo Māori programme outcomes. The draft intervention logic model was confirmed with Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori in November 2021. A copy of this is attached in appendix four. The intervention logic model will be tested and further refined as necessary over time.

Key findings

29. The findings are presented in three areas:

    a.) **Current operations and implementation:** this examines programme implementation processes, procedures, and systems including what has not worked, and covers:

    › programme resources, including programme staff and kaiako

    › communications and promotion

    › programme delivery including pre-entry/registration, wānanga, marking and final examinations

    › completion and attrition

    › reasons why people undertake Toi Reo Māori

    › programme content

    › database register of translators and interpreters.

    b.) **Future design considerations:** this focuses on programme and policy level issues to streamline the potential future delivery of the programme, and covers:

    › cohort size

    › statement of Performance Expectations targets

    › pass mark

    › standards-based assessment

    › Toi Reo Māori outcomes

    › ongoing support mechanisms

    › national association opportunity

    › macro environment for translation services

    › outsourcing training.

    c.) **Enablers and limitations of online delivery:** this looks at the factors which support or inhibit successful future online delivery.

30. The key findings section is arranged as follows:

    a.) description of what occurs, e.g. wānanga and what is involved

    b.) evaluation finding/s (if findings are identified), e.g. data analysed about the wānanga and evaluation finding/s.

31. The findings section then leads into the section on areas for improvement to the programme.

Current Operations and Implementation

Programme resources (including staff and kaiako)

32. Staffing for the programme has been relatively consistent in recent years. The passing of a long-time manager and lead for the Toi Reo Māori programme left significant gaps in knowledge and delivery of the programme. Fortunately, some of the institutional knowledge had been passed on to current staff who were able to continue to deliver Toi Reo Māori with minimal disruption.

33. The administration of Toi Reo Māori is managed by one full-time language service advisor who is sometimes supported by a part-time administrator during peak times. The language service advisor is responsible for managing the programme and ensuring delivery is effective and efficient.

34. The delivery of Toi Reo Māori currently involves three kaiako. Two of these have recently joined and one has been involved in the programme for several years. Previously the programme had four kaiako, but due to other priority work commitments, the programme now has three.

35. Four independent markers are also contracted by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. The markers assess candidates' pre-entry tests, wānanga assessments and final examinations. They assess candidates work against exemplar examples provided by the kaiako to standardise marking results. The markers are generally past kaiako.

Findings

36. The evaluation found that there are sufficient resources to manage and implement the programme. Due to the general shortage of qualified and experienced te reo Māori translators and interpreters, it would be difficult to expand the programme to an increased number of participants.

37. Evaluation participants and programme staff acknowledge that there is a good balance of old and new expertise and knowledge within the current teaching team. The new kaiako are part of a longer-term succession plan to ensure Toi Reo Māori is delivered consistently but allows for new pedagogical ideas and teaching methods to be incorporated.

38. Programme staff acknowledge that it is difficult to attract high calibre kaiako who can commit for the required periods for Toi Reo Māori. At this stage, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori is not actively looking to increase the number of kaiako, mainly due to a desire to retain the consistency and integrity of Toi Reo Māori

39. Managing the relationships with individual kaiako also requires the right skills by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to ensure the relationship is sound.

40. While the management of Toi Reo Māori is currently stable, succession planning is required to ensure institutional knowledge of the programme is retained, in the event that kaiako or programme staff were to be suddenly unavailable.

▶ Communications and promotions

41. Approximately two months prior to the opening of a Toi Reo Māori registration, key promotional and communication messages are sent out over Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori social media (Facebook, Twitter, Instagram) and general media channels, advising of the registration opening dates and general entry requirements for the programme.

Findings

42. Survey respondents reveal that most of them already knew about Toi Reo Māori or heard about it from personal acquaintances or someone who was connected to existing Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori communication channels such as Facebook.

43. There was a complaint from one candidate that it was difficult to locate up-to-date information on Toi Reo Māori and details on how to register. While this may be an isolated situation, and relates to earlier cohorts, it affected the enrolment experience for this candidate.

> *They weren't online and I was thinking man if they want people to become translators they should really advertise like on Facebook or wherever to bring people in. It was really hard, way harder than I'd have expected it to be. I was just lucky my mate enrolled, and they flicked me the details.*
> **PARTICIPANT**

44. Presently, the marketing and promotion of Toi Reo Māori is effective and reaches a wide audience both within and outside of Aotearoa. The current and recent cohort have candidates sitting the programme from London and Australia respectively.

▶ Entry / registration process

45. Candidates complete an expression of interest form and are then required to complete an online pre-entry test. The pre-entry test has been used for the past two cohorts to manage the large number of registrations of interest and to better assess the capabilities of prospective candidates. The pre-test also acts as a means for candidates to see the standard of work required for Toi Reo Māori, so they can opt out sooner if they realise they are not up to the required standard. Candidates complete the test online (comprising of an English and a te reo Māori passage to be translated), and these are sent off for external marking. Approximately 60 per cent of candidates pass the pre-entry test and proceed to the formal registration stage.

Findings

46. Although the pre-entry test has been a successful enhancement to Toi Reo Māori, the evaluation found that the pre-entry process could be strengthened further to better screen prospective candidates and reduce the attrition rate[7] of the programme. A few suggestions include:

7. Currently 33 per cent. The attrition rate is discussed further along in the report.

> › expanding the current online test to include more in-depth translation passages or multi-choice questions that test a range of prerequisite skills (e.g. grammar).
>
> › holding an online pre-entry wānanga to outline expectations, prerequisite requirements (such as strong te reo Māori and English capabilities) and outlining content that kaiako will not cover in Toi Reo Māori.

> *The pre-entry has been a good sifter! It makes them realise they need excellent English and excellent te reo, and some realise they are not there.*
>
> **TE TAURA WHIRI I TE REO MĀORI**

> *Lots of the candidates walk into Toi Reo Māori thinking that proficiency in te reo Māori equates to excellence in translation which in my opinion, is not the case, it is my strong opinion that translation is an expert class of work …. proficiency has to happen in both the source language and the target language and lots of people get that wrong.*
>
> **KAIAKO**

> *The nature of the work is so intense, and you have to be high performing, and the problem with how everyone is streamed into Toi Reo Māori is we assume everyone is proficient in English and Māori and that's a lot of the problem and we don't police that at all, their proficiency in English.*
>
> **KAIAKO**

47. Programme staff also suggested that prior to candidates undertaking the pre-entry test, they should voluntarily undertake a 'preliminary' pre-entry quiz. This 'preliminary' test could be placed online and include an 'exemplar' answer, so that individuals who are interested in registering for Toi Reo Māori can self-assess to see if they are at an acceptable standard to complete the programme. This approach would help reduce administrative strain on Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori resources during the pre-entry test process and give candidates a preliminary insight into whether they were ready for Toi Reo Māori and the work ahead of them.

48. Evaluation participants also commented that it would be useful to receive feedback on their pre-test results, rather than just a pass or fail notification. Feedback would provide candidates with insight about how they fared in the pre-entry test.

49. According to the evaluation survey results, candidates found that the pre-entry and registration process were relatively straightforward and easy to navigate. Eighty per cent said the process was simple and 70 per cent noted that they had a clear understanding of the pre-entry test process.

Wānanga: in-person and online

50. Before 2020/21, Toi Reo Māori consisted of four weekend wānanga held primarily at the Eastern Institute of Technology (EIT) in Napier. The final wānanga was the final oral and written examination which was also held at EIT. The in-person wānanga involved participants arriving on Friday evening and staying on-site at the EIT marae. Participants were required to fund their own transport to the wānanga, with the rest of the costs for the weekend (resources books, catering, teachers etc.) being covered by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori.

51. From this financial year,[8] Toi Reo Māori is being delivered online through four two-day weekend wānanga plus an additional online oral and written exam. This is due to the ongoing COVID-19 restrictions and the need to continue to deliver the programme.

52. Delivery over Zoom utilises the main classroom to deliver content, and smaller breakout rooms for kaiako to deliver content and engage more closely with candidates. Programme staff assign candidates to groups (in Zoom breakout rooms) based on their observations of individuals, and using criteria such as te reo Māori and English capability, and natural whānau groups (e.g. where they are in the same household or use the same computer).

53. The wānanga commences on Saturday morning and involves four classes per day rotating between each of the three kaiako. Each class covers different genre being taught, for example current affairs, law and policy, creative writing, and kōrero tawhito. Each wānanga also has an internal assessment component assigned to it, which all candidates complete.

Findings

54. Evaluation participants acknowledged the current COVID-19 circumstances and noted that online delivery was 'just a sign of the times' and was inevitable. Moving to online learning and delivery has been a learning process for candidates and kaiako. Some evaluation participants handled the situation well, while others struggled with the new learning environment.

> *Online learning was new for all of us. Te Taura Whiri was finding its way in delivering online, so it wasn't as polished as what it could be.*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

> *Teachers have had two odd years now to learn how to teach on Zoom and they're still learning, it was just really hard under those conditions.*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

55. The evaluation team observed one wānanga online and noted that one breakout room session went smoothly (no kaiako was present[9]). In the other breakout room, candidates seemed unclear on what the instructions for the lesson were, but eventually worked out what they had to do. In a face-to-face setting, it would have been easier to just ask what to do.

8. In the 2020/21 year, one of the wānanga was delivered online too.

9. This session did not require a kaiako. Candidates were given topics to write about.

56. Evaluation participants and programme staff agreed that more wānanga would be highly beneficial for candidates to revise learnings and spend more direct time with kaiako. Options could include extending current wānanga to three-day durations or holding a separate wānanga prior to the exam sitting. These options need to be considered in light of the broader budget constraints of Toi Reo Māori and the availability of kaiako.

Marking

Findings

57. Evaluation participants were highly critical of the marking process and the inconsistency between what kaiako are teaching and the assessments undertaken by markers. The evaluation found a myriad of issues around the marking of assessments and exams, including:

   › assessment results taking too long to come back to candidates

   › results getting lost

   › marker feedback that does not make sense

   › being marked incorrectly for something that was correct (and having marks deducted)

   › lack of meaningful feedback so candidates know how they can strengthen their work.

58. The interviews and evaluation surveys show that the feedback on the marking process is quite negative. The introduction of marking policy and guidelines that match the content being taught could help to address these issues.

> *I challenged them heaps on the marks I got because they didn't match up, the feedback I got from them didn't match with the marks I got back, and so I was just trying to find the middle ground between the teachers. One would say I really needed to look at this section and it didn't match up to what another said. In the end, whatever they arrived at I settled for it, and supported it. So that's maybe a problem, things don't match… it's not like they have to be exactly the same but if the teachers across the board are teaching one aspect of Toi Reo Māori it does kind of need to match what they're saying and how the marks turn out.*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

> *My teacher said to do it like this but the marker is saying do it the other way. There was no cohesion between the makers, and a lack of consistency. If anything, it is for Te Taura Whiri to kind of join the dots up between the markers and the teacher to get that cohesion and to decide on a way of teaching. You need to be on the same page with things like orthographic and the nitty gritty stuff. The interpreting is probably the hardest part to get that consistency, he rerekē te taha tuhi, so if I had a preference, it would be that. If they can tighten up on that between external marks and kaiako I think it'll be a robust process.*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

59. The evaluation also found that there are varying views about whether markers should be independent from kaiako or whether kaiako and markers need to be more closely aligned (or the same person). There were suggestions that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori should consider employing a full-time kaiako over the duration of Toi Reo Māori to teach and mark assessments and examinations.

> *We've talked a lot about markers in the past. Kaiako have said it's better not to be involved because it's protection for the kaiako and I can see that, but personally I like to get in on the marking because I want to see where everyone is at, and I want to plan lectures that fix the common mistakes.*
>
> **KAIAKO**

▶ Final examination

60. Prior to COVID-19, Toi Reo Māori involved an internal assessment worth 40 per cent. The final examination was worth 60 per cent. This has now changed. For the current cohort of 2021/22, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori changed the assessment criteria to 90 per cent internal assessment and 10 per cent weighting for the external examination. Feedback from evaluation participants support the change to a higher weighting for internal assessments than for a one-off examination.

Findings

61. The heavy weighting on the external examination (four questions in four hours) placed significant pressure on candidates to perform under pressure and in conditions that did not reflect the realities of real-life translation work. There were consistent views across evaluation participants and programme staff (including kaiako) that the heavily weighted examination was out of date, that it did not reflect current pedagogical practice, and did not provide a fair assessment of the capabilities of candidates.

62. The current change in the examination weighting to 10 per cent reflects a more balanced approach and better aligns with the standards-based approach that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori is currently exploring.

Completion/ attrition rate

63. In 2020/21, a total of 49[10] candidates passed Toi Reo Māori as follows:

    › 14 candidates were awarded both the translator and interpreter certificate.

    › 32 were awarded the translator certificate.

    › Three were awarded the interpreter certificate.

64. The current pass rate for Toi Reo Māori is approximately 33 per cent of the total candidates. Approximately 33 per cent of candidates drop out over the course of Toi Reo Māori, while the remaining fail the programme.

Findings

65. Some of the common reasons for dropping out of Toi Reo Māori are:

    › Candidates find they are overcommitted with other whānau and/or hapori priorities, as many are reo champions in their communities and marae.

    › Toi Reo Māori workload is too much.

    › Content is too complex.

    › Candidates do not have the knowledge or competency.

66. There are no particular times when candidates tend to drop out during the course of Toi Reo Māori, since it is dependent on the individual's personal circumstances.

> *We had one person drop out just before sitting the exam, they had done all the other work, but for some reason [we don't know why] they didn't want to sit the exam.*
>
> **TE TAURA WHIRI I TE REO MĀORI**

Reasons why people undertake Toi Reo Māori

Findings

67. The demand for Toi Reo Māori has increased exponentially in recent years. The increased number of candidates enrolling in the programme is influenced by several factors, including:

    › the desire by candidates to further develop their te reo Māori capabilities and be tested against a national standard. Over half (58 per cent) of survey respondents noted that they undertook Toi Reo Māori to test their te reo Māori capabilities. Many evaluation participants had exhausted other tertiary or professional development pathways and wanted something new to try.

> *We didn't actually go for the accreditation, we went to grow, to strengthen and better our language because we were all teachers of the language. We wanted to better our reo, to reach that higher standard.*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

10. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori, Annual Report 2020/21

› candidates choosing to have a career as a licensed translator or interpreter of te reo Māori. Just over a quarter (26 per cent) of survey respondents stated that financial incentives and benefits were the drivers for sitting Toi Reo Māori.

› candidates being encouraged and supported by their workplaces to sit Toi Reo Māori to build the capability of the workplace's workforce and enable translation services to be undertaken in-house.

› the formal recognition of becoming a licensed translator and interpreter. Seventy per cent of survey respondents stated they were motivated by the status and recognition of obtaining higher learning honours.

▶ Programme content

68. The content for Toi Reo Māori is refreshed each year by the kaiako and programme staff. The workbook provides a useful resource for self-directed learning. Content for the oral exam is reused as it is more difficult to memorise content from previous exam sittings, given the limited time and speed at which the oral content is delivered.

Findings

69. Evaluation participants noted that the content was thorough, and the different genres provided exposure to the different types of potential future work opportunities. Survey responses show that:

› Almost 60 per cent of respondents strongly agree or agree that wānanga content was pitched at the right level.

› Just under three quarters (74 per cent) agreed that the delivery of content by the kaiako was clear.

70. The evaluation identified a few issues around the development and delivery of content and the running of online sessions. These included that:

› Content was not tailored or adapted for online delivery. Note that this was feedback by candidates from the 2020/21 online cohort.

› Initial settling period is needed to familiarise with technologies and how best to deliver content online. There were technology issues early on where video clips failed to play (without audio or picture), resulting in frustration.

› Lack of dedicated resources that support the learning. There were suggestions that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori should develop:

› tailored teaching content such as 10–15-minute clips to reinforce the learning and allow candidates to re-watch and come back later for further discussion or questions

- › a digital repository of recommended te reo Māori linguistic resources and exercises (for grammar rules, etc.) for more in-depth learning and upskilling

- › templates or style guides on how assignments should be formatted

- › calendar/schedule of dates for wānanga, assignments (when issued and due dates) and respective weightings (saved in a shared online location such as Google Drive or Dropbox)

- › toolkits or additional content around proofreading, publishing, and editing processes such as using tracked changes and comments in Microsoft Word when communicating with clients.

- › Kaiako had to develop content on the fly, in isolation of an overarching curriculum plan or existing resources or content.

- › A central repository is needed to store programme content and resources for re-use in other cohorts.

- › There is a need for better understanding of the international industry standards for translation and interpretation, and how these can be applied to Toi Reo Māori.

71. The evaluation also noted that content for translation and interpretation is not clearly delineated in the current programme. From an industry perspective, interpretation is treated as a distinct field, whereas the Toi Reo Māori programme treats interpretation and translation as one. This tends to blend the programme content, meaning the candidates receive the same training material regardless of whether they are sitting translators' and or interpreters' certification. This approach does not recognise the unique differences of each certification and the different skill sets of interpreters and translators.

72. There were suggestions that Toi Reo Māori could benefit from having an experienced curriculum developer (or learning designer) review the current curriculum and work with kaiako to confirm learning objectives, content, teaching strategies, sequence of learning activities, and the type and frequency of assessments. The curriculum developer could also confirm the technology required (such as using Google Hangouts, Canvas, Moodle or other) to support the online learning. This approach would also support ongoing continuous improvement and regular evaluation cycles for the curriculum.

The translators and interpreters' register (database)

73. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori maintains the translators and interpreters' register of people who have successfully completed Toi Reo Māori. As at February 2022, there were 213 people on the register, however the number of people who are actively working in the industry is unknown, as Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori does not track this detail until candidates come forward or become known to them. For many years the register was just a static list on Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori website, with limited information and functionality to assist those looking to procure translation services or for those looking to promote themselves as practitioners.

Currently the register is going through a refresh, with updated information including profiles of individuals and increased search functionality such as their fields of expertise (government, policy, education, etc.), region they cover, service they provide (translator, interpreter, or translator and interpreter) and contact details.

Future design considerations

Cohort size

74. Currently, approximately 85 candidates are sitting Toi Reo Māori in 2021/22. Previous cohort sizes have ranged between 28 and 65 people. The evaluation found that the recent number of candidates is too great, compromises the delivery of Toi Reo Māori and puts additional pressure on kaiako, causing frustration.

> There were way too many students, over 100 at the beginning. It's way too many to be teaching people who aren't at the level. They don't get the quality time they need to appropriately prepare for the industry, you're too busy trying to teach everyone.
>
> **KAIAKO**

75. The increased number of candidates has pre-empted calls to place a cap on the number of participants in Toi Reo Māori so that it remains manageable from a teaching perspective and that more quality student-teacher interactions can occur.

> We need to cap the rego process, [we] didn't expect such a huge interest…. a lot of this cohort has come out of the woodwork. We had a criteria and pre-requisite qualifications such as Panekiretanga, BA Māori, which a lot of them already had, so we had to push them thru.
>
> **TE TAURA WHIRI I TE REO MĀORI**

76. Programme staff believe a cap of a maximum of approximately 20 students, and ideally 15 students per kaiako, (i.e. a total of a maximum of 60 for three kaiako) provides for optimum quality interactions and for managing the intense learning required through Toi Reo Māori.

77. Currently, there is one cohort per annum. If the cohort size reduces, there is an opportunity to have more than one cohort per annum. This would, however, place additional costs and pressure on existing resources for the programme where the pool of quality and qualified kaiako is limited.

Statement of Performance Expectations targets

78. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori have three explicit measures for Toi Reo Māori in the 2021/22 Statement of Performance Expectations (SPE). These measures are:

    › 50[11] participants are in Toi Reo Māori training: This target is achievable given the current cohort has 85 candidates undertaking the programme.

    › 50[12] individuals are active licensed translators and interpreters: This target will be difficult to measure as there is no system of tracking who is actively working in the space.

    › 70 per cent of Toi Reo Māori participants measurably right-shift: This target is currently being measured in the 2021/22 cohort.

79. Robust measurement systems and processes are needed to ensure the current SPE performance targets can be effectively measured.

Setting the pass mark

80. The current pass mark is set at 80 per cent (cumulative internal and external assessments) by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. There are strong views that the current rate is set too low and compromises the overall integrity and credibility of Toi Reo Māori.

    > *I would be pretty gutted if I hired someone to translate something for me and they only got it 80 per cent right. I think a lot of people on the course weren't actually at the correct level to have gotten in.*
    >
    > **PARTICIPANT**

81. From a practical perspective, lowering the pass rate has the perception of lowering the quality of the qualification, while also enabling more candidates to pass. Maintaining a higher pass mark ensures higher quality candidates are achieving Toi Reo Māori and sets high expectations for qualified translators and the standard of work.

    > *We pushed the pass rate up to 90 per cent. I don't know if that was the right move because it encourages the patu wairua stuff but we asked the coordinator to push the pass rate to 90 per cent and I back that because on a good day I sit at the 95% but I aim for that 99 per cent, but under that you're making way too many errors or taking way too many liberties, and that's not okay.*
    >
    > **KAIAKO**

    > *Then [Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori] decided to whakaheke the paearu eke to 80 per cent without consulting the teachers. Every one of us are actually in the industry practising the mahi, and it felt like Toi Reo Māori is really about just getting numbers over the line.*
    >
    > **KAIAKO**

11. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori, 2021/2022 Statement of Performance Expectations, Measure 4.2 (page 25)

12. Ibid, measure 4.1 (page 25)

Standards framework

82. There are consistent views that the Toi Reo Māori assessment framework should be reviewed, and a new standards framework developed that is culturally aligned and supports current learning practices. The research, to be undertaken by Auckland University, is looking to identify suitable international standards that can be adopted to inform the development of a new framework for Toi Reo Māori.

83. Recent changes to Toi Reo Māori, such as increasing the weighting of internal assessments, is highly supported and signals a move towards a standards-based assessment framework. A standards or module-based approach allows content to be delivered in manageable parts where candidates undertake the learning and obtain credits based on achieving the core competencies. This approach is geared towards a longer-term development pathway for candidates.

84. The evaluation also noted that moving to a standards-based framework may assist with reducing the high fail rate (approximately 33 per cent) of candidates in Toi Reo Māori by allowing candidates to re-sit standards or modules until they have achieved the credits. This was viewed as a more effective way to manage candidates' expectations and ensure Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori investment is not wasted by having candidates fail or withdraw.

85. Future options for Toi Reo Māori may involve considering removing the examination component completely in favour of full internal assessment, or retaining the current hybrid model of internal and external assessment.

Disconnection between Toi Reo Māori outcomes

86. The evaluation noted the tension between the goals of Toi Reo Māori (i.e. to increase access to and supply of licensed translators and interpreters working in the profession) with candidates enrolling just to improve their te reo Māori capabilities with, no thought about entering the translation or interpretation professions. There are mixed views about whether Toi Reo Māori should maintain the status quo or whether it should only concentrate on those candidates pursuing a professional translator or interpreter career.

> *I think they come in thinking this is a kura reo and they're coming to see what this one does. I think that we should provide an alternative space for that to happen. There are other people that want this knowledge [translation & interpretation] so they can create a career path out of it.*
>
> **KAIAKO**

87. Targeting those individuals interested in being a translator or interpreter may provide better outcomes as more time and resources can be used to target the specific development needs of candidates. However, by only targeting those individuals, candidates that are not entirely certain of their future career pathway (at the time they sit Toi Reo Māori) may be excluded. The evaluation noted that some candidates were still considering their options and while they had not confirmed whether they would or would not enter the profession, the certification gave them options if they were to take it up later.

88. The evaluation also noted that the intended outcomes of the programme were not widely known or embedded within Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. The development of the intervention logic by the evaluation team highlighted this issue and identified the need to promote the outcomes more widely, so that there is greater clarity about what the programme is aiming to achieve.

▶ Ongoing support mechanisms

89. There are no formal professional development pathways or mechanisms that are te reo Māori specific to support licensed translators and interpreters once they have completed Toi Reo Māori. The New Zealand Society of Translators and Interpreters (NZSTI) provides professional development opportunities for its affiliated members, but these do not explicitly target the needs of Toi Reo Māori candidates. Regardless, there are still merits and benefits for candidates to access mainstream development opportunities through NZSTI.

90. There are also no formal processes to support candidates who are on the cusp of passing but require a little more direct support to get them across the line.

91. There is consensus among evaluation participants and programme staff that further ongoing support needs to be provided to candidates so they can continue to improve their quality of work and professional practice. Structured tutorials, forums to network with other translators and one-on-one mentoring (through a professional body or established translators) were suggested as possible options to support both practising translators and interpreters and those currently undertaking Toi Reo Māori.

> *I'm of the opinion we need to have PD for our current people. You get your licence, and you get it forever, but how is there any quality assurance across the spectrum, how is there PD to ensuring licence to develop at that kounga level? How can you continue that support outside of peer support groups? Maybe Te Taura Whiri could come out with workshops as an option for people to come together, just to really figure… new words, different areas, ensuring that this is top-grade quality, how can we continue providing this support?*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

92. The evaluation also suggested that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori consider a recertification process after a period (for example every five years) to ensure candidates are continuing to maintain high standards of practice and remain committed to the industry. It was suggested that the recertification process be tied to ongoing professional development such as mentoring support through a professional association.

93. As mentioned earlier, the evaluation noted that more resources need to be targeted towards candidates who are within close reaches of passing Toi Reo Māori but may need more guided experience and support. A 'finishing class' was suggested to provide this support.

▶ National association or representative body

94. The evaluation identified the need to support a professional body or association (like NZSTI) to represent the interests of te reo Māori translators and interpreters. Te Kāhui Whakamāori Incorporated was established in 2019 with the purpose of it becoming the professional association to support Māori translators and interpreters. As an independent association, Te Kāhui Whakamāori requires resources and support to become fully established and effective as a representative body for Māori translators and interpreters.

95. It is intended that Te Kāhui Whakamāori will help bridge the capability and industry standards gap between the Māori translators and interpreters' sector and the wider translation and interpreters' industry in Aotearoa. It is widely acknowledged that NZSTI and other industry groups hold significant institutional and industry knowledge that Māori translators and interpreters could benefit from in terms of professional practice and international standards.

96. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori has made a financial commitment to support the establishment of Te Kāhui Whakamāori as the formal professional association for Māori translators and interpreters. A detailed business case is required to ensure that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori support for Te Kāhui Whakamāori is adequate to support the wide range of services that are expected of a professional association, such as professional development opportunities, further learning resources, mentoring, peer support groups, advocacy, membership management, and processes for complaints and disciplinary procedures.

97. There are also suggestions that discussions with NZSTI, Te Kāhui Whakamāori and Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori take place to share information, understand respective priorities, and discuss emerging issues across the industry. These discussions could lead to long-term opportunities to collaborate and leverage the collective expertise of organisations, as well as contribute to a more active role for Māori translators and interpreters in the wider industry.

Macro environment for translation services

98. The evaluation noted that the Government adopted the National Accreditation Authority for Translators and Interpreters (NAATI)[13] system of interpreter standards and associated certification for those doing interpreting work in the New Zealand public sector as part of the Language Assistance Services Programme (LASP).[14] This means that only NAATI-certified interpreters (does not affect translators) will be able to provide interpreting services to the New Zealand public sector from 1 July 2024.

99. Subsequent discussions between Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori and the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment, as the lead agency in partnership with the Department of Internal Affairs, has resulted in the removal of te reo Māori interpreters from the provisions of the NAATI certification.

100. There is a risk that the Government's broader desire to standardise certification frameworks for interpreters, and potentially translators (in the future), may overshadow the legislative role of Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori and leave it in a precarious position unless assurances are given that te reo Māori translators and interpreters are exempt from the NAATI framework.

101. Again, it would also be useful for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to develop strategic relationships with NAATI in an effort to keep abreast of their standards framework and potentially support the development of Toi Reo Māori standards.

Outsourcing training

102. There are varying views about whether Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori should just provide their legislative role of certifying successful candidates, and leave the training of translators and interpreters to specialised providers. It was noted that this outsourcing option was considered by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori previously, however due to the lack of suitable te reo Māori expert providers to deliver this service, training was retained in-house. Outsourcing would still enable Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to maintain control over the programme and content, but without needing to invest significantly in internal infrastructure and specialist expertise. The separation of the certification and training roles is a topic that could be further explored following the completion of this evaluation.

13. NAATI is the association for all the qualified translators and interpreters recognised in Australia for the translations of official documents and for interpreting services requested by non-English speakers.

14. LASP, a new standards and certification framework for language practitioners working across the New Zealand public sector.

Enablers and limitations of online delivery

103. The evaluation noted several factors which enabled positive experiences during online delivery. These included candidates having:

    › good (strong) internet connection

    › dedicated quiet space (away from other distractions) during wānanga

    › good level of technical capabilities to manage Zoom meetings and computer hardware issues such as audio or visual issues associated with online calls or viewing content (e.g. on YouTube).

104. Evaluation participants commented on the following benefits of holding Toi Reo Māori online:

    › Convenience: evaluation participants liked the convenience of online and being able to learn from the comfort of their own environment. This enabled them to balance their studies and home duties during breaks and after sessions. Survey responses show that a large proportion (80 per cent) of respondents found it convenient and easy to work in an online setting.

    › Cost effective: there are obvious cost savings for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori in venue hire, catering, and travel costs for staff through online delivery. Participants are also able to save on travel costs to and from wānanga in Napier.

105. The evaluation also noted the following limitations with online delivery:

    › Some learners are disadvantaged by the technology. Younger learners are more suited to online as they are already equipped with digital and technology skills. Programme staff commented that approximately seven per cent of candidates are not technologically savvy and find online engagement extremely difficult. Candidates' inability to navigate the technology also impacts negatively on the learning experience of some other candidates who are frustrated by having to work at a slower pace or to repeat things.

    > *We had one lady who was brilliant, in class. She was good at both English and Māori, but she couldn't work the Zoom, [she would] sit there writing as she didn't know how to use the computer and know how to run the tech. She dropped off because of the technology.*
    >
    > **TE TAURA WHIRI I TE REO MĀORI**

› Technical issues with internet connectivity (and Zoom): although not a common occurrence, there remains concern over adequate back-up processes or systems if the technology goes down during an online session. Programme staff commented that connection issues are generally resolved within 10 minutes, and work around solutions such as emailing all candidates to continue with translation work until connection is re-established is workable in the interim.

› Evaluation participants also raised the issue that poor connectivity in some rural locations (at times) affected their ability to fully participate.

› Loss of interpersonal connection/whanaungatanga: many evaluation participants commented that online delivery loses the essence of classroom interactions and the ability to establish deep relationships and connections with their peers. Online delivery also erodes the ability of candidates to network and work collectively with other candidates in more intimate settings.

> *It doesn't have the same wairua as sitting in a classroom and the interaction amongst students: don't get networking time, don't get to make connections. Still doing it on Facebook and Messenger, however a lot of essence left out, miss the teaching nuances, energy and vibe.*
>
> **TE TAURA WHIRI I TE REO MĀORI**

› Perception of loss of quality teaching and learning experiences: evaluation participants commented that working online for two whole days is mentally and physically taxing, which affects learning experiences. There is also a view that online delivery can mask candidates understanding of content and whether they have grasped the concepts being taught.

> *Hard to sit in front of a screen for long periods, not healthy not good, I think it's more intense online, sitting at your desk learning is not as comfortable [as] sitting with peers.*
>
> **TE TAURA WHIRI I TE REO MĀORI**

> *You'll never see that online, if there are heaps of students in the class. Some turn their cameras off, some are too anxious to speak. But in class, as the teacher is turning around to you and looks right at you, you know 'that finger is pointing at me, I need to say something'.*
>
> **PARTICIPANT**

› Managing deceptive behaviour: there are potential risks that candidates may cheat during assessments and online exams. While the risks are low, these issues could be managed through technology tools and clear guidelines and policies.

› Protection of intellectual property: some kaiako do not want their teaching sessions recorded as there is no control over how widely the content is shared and used. This reduces the accessibility of on-demand content and the ability for candidates to revise learnings as, and when, required.

Technology tools

106. Toi Reo Māori does not currently use or endorse any technology tools for translation and interpretation services that meet current industry standards. The evaluation noted that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori, through its transformation project, is already exploring opportunities to modernise its technology infrastructure to support innovative teaching and learning approaches across its business.

107. The likely transition to online delivery of assessments and exams also presents opportunities for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to use software such as translation memory software, digital assessment, remote proctoring, and e-marking tools to streamline administrative processes for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. An online solution should also provide safe and secure services to prevent deceptive behaviour, provide better online learning and assessment and a better user experience for candidates, kaiako and the programme staff.

108. There are many free or paid software solutions on the market that provide course management and online and offline learning capabilities. Course management software would greatly improve efficiencies in the administration of the programme and provide a better user experience for candidates. Some suggested software for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to consider include:

    › Canvas: a portal where students can view information including course slides, course readings, assessments, grades, course calendars, course announcements/communication. This software is currently being used at the Victoria University of Wellington.

    › Moodle: a fully customisable open-source free to download and distribute learning management system that creates personalised learning environments. This software has broad functionality including collaboration tools that enable teachers and students to interact easily.

    › Google Hangouts: an all-in-one online communication tool. It allows users to find contacts and send messages (or pictures or videos) and hold video chats.

Areas for improvement

109. The evaluation identified areas where Toi Reo Māori could be improved. Some areas are already being considered as part of the wider transformation programme that Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori has underway, e.g. exploring online solutions. Other proposed improvements seek to strengthen Toi Reo Māori as it moves to an online delivery setting.

Table 1: Proposed improvements: Programme design

Focus area	Issues	Proposed Improvement	Rationale
Pre-entry/ registration	The pre-entry test stage is resource intensive, requiring all pre-entry tests to be independently marked.	Develop a voluntary preliminary pre-entry quiz that is accessible on the website and offers immediate results once submitted. (NB. This process supplements the existing pre-entry test).	Introducing another voluntary pre-entry assessment stage may reduce unnecessary administrative strain, provide immediate results, and enable individuals to self-assess and determine if they are ready for Toi Reo Māori.
		Redesign the pre-entry test so that results are automatically provided through electronic marking software.	Reducing the need to send pre-entry tests off to independent markers will save costs and administrative time.
	Some candidates enter Toi Reo Māori without the required skills (even though they pass the pre-entry test) or knowledge to successfully complete Toi Reo Māori.	Undertake additional screening and assessment of candidates such as more in-depth translation passages or testing other prerequisite skills (grammar etc.) Provide an online wānanga to outline expectations.	Candidates without the required skills or knowledge place additional pressure on kaiako to provide tuition.
Wānanga	Current wānanga do not provide enough contact time between candidates and kaiako for extended quality learning opportunities.	Increase the number of wānanga on offer and/or extend the length of current wānanga.	More wānanga would be highly beneficial for candidates to revise learnings and spend more direct time with kaiako.
Marking	Inconsistent messages between what kaiako are teaching and how assessments are marked.	Develop a marking policy and guidelines for Toi Reo Māori that match the content being taught. Employ a dedicated fulltime kaiako to teach and mark assessments and exams.	Greater alignment of teaching content and marking will ensure consistent messaging back to candidates.

Focus area	Issues	Proposed Improvement	Rationale
Programme content	There is a lack of resources to support the delivery of teaching content.	Develop dedicated resources that support the learning objectives and online sessions. These include: › tailored teaching content such as 10–15-minute clips › digital repository of recommended te reo Māori linguistic resources › templates or style guides for how assignments should be formatted. › calendar/schedule of dates for wānanga, assignments (when issued and due dates) and respective weightings › toolkits or additional content around proofreading, publishing, and editing processes.	New resources will provide a better user experience for candidates and ensure the programme delivery is effective. On-demand content allows candidates to learn at their own pace (i.e. watch/use content when required).
	Content for translation and interpretation is not clearly delineated in the current programme.	Delineate unique content required for translators and that for interpreters.	From an industry perspective, interpretation is treated as a distinct field.
	There is no overarching curriculum plan or framework for delivery of the programme.	Engage a curriculum developer to review the current programme and develop a curriculum plan that delivers the learning objectives, teaching strategies, resources and assessments.	
	There are no centralised repositories for teaching content. Content is largely derived from personal sources of the kaiako, which exposes the programme if kaiako were to exit the programme.	Develop a centralised storage facility for learning and teaching documentation. Develop programme resources (in collaboration with kaiako) based on curriculum plan.	
	International translation and interpretation standards are not widely taught or known within the programme.	Provide more targeted content and context around international standards for translation. and interpretation. Upskill kaiako so they have the necessary information to teach this subject area.	Greater alignment with industry standards will lift the credibility of the programme.

Table 2: Proposed improvements: Policy development

Focus area	Issues	Proposed Improvement	Rationale
Cohort size	Increased number of candidates sitting Toi Reo Māori resulting in heavy workloads for kaiako and less one-on-one time with candidates.	Set a cap of a maximum of approximately 20 students per kaiako, and ideally 15 students per kaiako Consider the option of holding more than one cohort per annum, subject to the availability of resources and time.	A smaller cohort size provides for quality interaction and management of the intense teaching and learning environments.
Statement of Performance Expectations (SPE) targets	There are no systems in place to track or monitor individuals who are actively working in the translation and interpreter space. (This relates to measure 4.1 in the SPE)	Review the current SPE targets to ensure they can be measured.	The SPE targets need to be evidence-based and achievable. Robust systems for measuring the targets need to be in place.
Pass mark	Current pass mark is set at 80% by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori which allows a lot more candidates to pass. This has the potential to compromise the overall integrity and credibility of Toi Reo Māori, with candidates passing who are not at the required high standard.	Revise the pass mark so it balances the requirement for achieving high quality candidates with increasing the number of licensed translators and interpreters.	Setting a higher benchmark pass mark means that only high-performing candidates will achieve the required standard. This gives the certification more credibility.
Standards-based assessment	Partial transition to a standards-based approach has been tested, with positive outcomes. Previous assessments were heavily focused on the final exam. The programme has already moved to a larger internal assessment component.	Formally adopt a standards-based approach to assessment. Develop suitable standards based on research evidence (Auckland University research). Engage a content developer/planner to redesign learning modules and develop a structured curriculum plan.	Standards-based assessment reflects current learning practices. This approach also gives more flexibility to the assessment process and can allow for resits, and working at the pace of learners.
Toi Reo Māori outcomes	There is a disconnection between the goals of Toi Reo Māori (i.e. to increase access to and supply of licensed translators and interpreters working in the profession) with candidates enrolling in Toi Reo Māori just to improve their te reo Māori capabilities, with no thought about entering the translation or interpretation profession.	Clearly define the purpose and intended target group for Toi Reo Māori. This may include developing separate streams for those looking at translation and interpretation as a future profession and another stream for others.	Targeting only those interested in being a translator or interpreter may provide better outcomes through more targeted support and resources.
	Programme goals are not widely known, resulting in lack of clarity and direction for the programme.	Embed/widely socialise the programme goals through internal and external communications.	Clearly defining the programme goals will ensure Toi Reo Māori targets time, money and resources appropriately.

Focus area	Issues	Proposed Improvement	Rationale
Support mechanisms	Once candidates are certified, there are no ongoing support mechanisms to develop their work and professional practice. Feedback shows that some current licensed translators and interpreters need upskilling to provide better services to clients.	Develop a learning and development programme package including professional development opportunities, resources, networking opportunities and mentoring/peer support groups.	Ongoing professional development ensures that the required standards are being maintained.
		Develop a recertification process after a set period to ensure candidates are continuing to maintain high standards of practice and remain committed to the industry.	
		Develop a 'finishing class' stream to support candidates who are close to passing but need more direct support to successfully complete Toi Reo Māori.	Supporting candidates that are close to passing (but not quite there) provides better outcomes for the programme.
National association or representative body	Te Kāhui Whakamāori has recently been established as an independent formal professional body to represent and support practising reo Māori translators and interpreters. As such it requires resources for its operations so that certified and practising translators and interpreters are supported.	Provide resources to build the capacity and capability of Te Kāhui Whakamāori as the professional association for Māori translators and interpreters.	A professional body could provide the necessary support that practising professionals require to maintain and enhance quality standards.
Technology	Currently, Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori does not use any software to support the administration and delivery of Toi Reo Māori.	Develop or procure a learning management system to support course management and administration of the programme. Investigate options to use translation memory software, digital assessment, remote proctoring (if required), and e-marking tools.	Technology provides efficiencies that can streamline processes and deliver a more efficient and effective experience for candidates, kaiako and programme staff.
Outsourcing training	There are varying views about whether Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori should just provide their legislative role of certifying successful candidates and leave the training of translators and interpreters to specialised providers	Explore the option of potentially outsourcing the training, while retaining the certification of translators and interpreters in-house.	Outsourcing would still enable Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori to approve the programme and content, without the need to contract the required specialist expertise.

Conclusion

1

110.

Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori acknowledges that Toi Reo Māori requires significant work to lift it to a world-class international standard.

Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori is open-to change and has a strong desire to continue to support developing and established translators and interpreters through better targeted support (including pastoral care). The establishment of an effective professional body and the delivery of a comprehensive learning and development programme are imperative to raising the standards to achieve an internationally recognised certification programme.

2

111.

Online is the preferred way to deliver Toi Reo Māori, with COVID-19 continuing to have a daily impact on businesses, communities and homes.

Online delivery will continue, so future enhancements to Toi Reo Māori will need to balance the technological, cultural, and spiritual nuances of online versus in-person learning.

3

112.

Technology tools will be a necessary addition to the programme to enhance the administration of the programme while also giving candidates a better user experience for online and offline learning.

4

113.

The widespread use of te reo Māori in communities, workplaces, homes, and learning environments provides immense opportunities for Toi Reo Māori to continue to contribute to the achievement of the overarching vision and goals of Te Whare o te Reo Mauriora through the provision of quality translation and interpretation services.

Appendix One:
Information sheet

Evaluation of The Toi Reo Māori programme: Information Sheet

What is Toi Reo Māori?	The Toi Reo Māori programme is the only recognised te reo Māori translators and interpreters' qualification available in Aotearoa. It sits outside any formal qualification framework (such as NZQA) and is administered solely by Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori in accordance with its legislation.
What is the purpose of the evaluation?	The purpose of the evaluation is to understand how well the Toi Reo Māori programme is being implemented, identify the barriers and facilitators of success and identify improvements to the programme.
Who is conducting the evaluation?	The evaluation is being conducted by R&K Consultants Ltd and Associates on behalf of Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. The evaluation team members are: › Reece Kohatu, Ngāti Tūwharetoa, Ngāti Raukawa, Ngāti Maniapoto › Vini Olsen-Reeder: Ngā Pōtiki a Tamapahore, Ngāti Pūkenga, Ngāti Whakaue › Toni Roberts: Waikato, Te Waiohua, Ngāpuhi
How is information being gathered?	Information will be gathered through a desktop review, surveys and interviews with past Toi Reo Māori examination participants and kaiako. Interviews will be held by phone, Zoom or MS Teams. How will information be stored and used? › Data is stored securely on the evaluation team's Dropbox. › All notes, transcripts, audios, and consent forms are in password protected folders and are anonymised. › Data will be used to inform an evaluation report
What are the timeframes for this evaluation?	Interviews will be conducted from January to March 2022. A draft evaluation report is due by May 2022, with the final report due by June 2022.
What are my rights?	It is your choice whether or not you wish to take part in the evaluation. If you do not wish to participate, you do not have to give a reason. Only the evaluation team will know who has been approached to participate and this will not be shared with Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori. If you agree to take part, you will be asked to read and complete a consent form. The evaluation team will also verbally outline your rights. If you wish, your interview can be in te reo Māori.
Will I get a copy of the final report?	The report is being prepared for Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori and is planned for public release once key stakeholders (including yourself) have been consulted.
Who do I contact with questions or concerns?	If you have any questions or concerns, please contact Reece Kohatu

Appendix Two:
Consent form

Evaluation of the Toi Reo Māori Programme: Consent Form

I understand that:

› My participation is voluntary, and I can withdraw at any time.

› If I do take part, I can refuse to answer any questions I do not want to answer.

› I can choose to be interviewed in te reo Māori.

› My name or identifying information will not be included in the evaluation without my permission.

› With my permission, the discussion will be audio recorded, and may be transcribed.

› I have the right to request a copy of the audio or transcript of my discussion.

› Digital recordings, notes, and summaries will be stored securely. Hard copies of stored information will be destroyed one month after project completion.

› My information will not be shared with anyone outside of the evaluation team. Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori may request my notes in exceptional circumstances. If so, these notes will not include any identifying information.

› Any information I provide can be removed at my request up until 1 May 2022.

I have read the information sheet and consent form and been given the opportunity to ask questions. I give my consent to participate in this evaluation.

Name
_____

Signature
_____

Date
_____

If you have any pātai, you can call the project lead, Reece Kohatu

Appendix Three: Toi Reo Māori Evaluation Interview Guide

This table will be used to guide conversations during the semi-structured interviews with stakeholders. The sub-questions will be further refined as more information about the Toi Reo Māori programme is known, i.e. after the surveys and before the interviews.

Focus	Key evaluation questions	Sub-questions (not an exhaustive list)
Process (workflow)	How well is the Toi Reo Māori programme being implemented? What activities or approaches have or haven't worked well for the Toi Reo Māori programme? What changes, if any, are required to improve the effectiveness of the Toi Reo Māori programme?	**Registration** › How effective is the online registration process? › How could it be improved? **Resource development** › How much effort (e.g. time and resource) is used to develop the learning resources? › Is the content relevant, fit for purpose? **Wānanga/ training** › How effective are the wānanga? › Is the content effective? (pitched at right level, relevant, helpful) › Are the facilitators effective in delivering their content? › How can the wānanga be improved? › How have you found the online delivery? (What worked, what didn't?) **Examination** › How effective is the exam question preparation process? › How can the examination process be improved? **Post-exam follow-up** › What support is required post-exam to support your development as a … › What future support is required to support your attainment of certification? **Promotions/communication** › How can the programme be better promoted? › How effective is the communication/promotion of the programme? **Programme management** › Is the current resource allocation sufficient to deliver the programme? › How can the programme management be improved?

Focus	Key evaluation questions	Sub-questions (not an exhaustive list)
Online delivery	What are the enablers for effective online delivery of the programme? What are the limitations and/or risks of online delivery of the programme?	› What are the drivers for moving the programme to online delivery? › What are the benefits of online delivery? › Do you see any limitations, problems or risks with an online setting for Toi Reo Māori? E.g. access to internet, access to hardware and software, access to quiet setting, sitting Toi Reo Māori alongside other participants online, techno-phobic participants › Is online delivery more effective than other delivery approaches? › How has the online delivery been progressing for the current cohort of participants?

Appendix Four: Intervention Logic (confirmed November 2021)

Drivers and Opportunity	Intervention	Inputs	Outputs[15]	Short-term outcomes[16]	Long-term outcomes[17]
Te Ture mō Te Reo Māori 2016 gives Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori the authority to license as translators and/or interpreters those who achieve the required standards The Toi Reo Māori programme is the pathway for translators and interpreters to be licensed, provided they meet the required standards	A programme is delivered to assess whether a person's proficiency in te reo Māori meets the required standards to become a licensed translator and/or interpreter	› $200,000 programme management › $100,000[18] online operation › Toi Reo Māori policy and guidelines › course materials › assessment framework › course participants › ICT support (software and hardware)	Participants sit Toi Reo Māori in 2021/22	Increase the supply and demand of licensed translators and interpreters Increase the public's access to licensed translators and interpreters Increase the capability of translators and interpreters	More people highly proficient in te reo Māori NZers have the ability and confidence to talk about at least basic things in te reo Māori
Shortage of active licensed te reo Māori interpreters and translators		# FTE to manage and administer programme	Participants complete Toi Reo Māori	Maintain the quality of licensed translators and interpreters	NZers value te reo Māori as a key element of national identity
Translators and interpreters can complete the course and work in this field		Monitoring and evaluation activities	Evaluation report		
Online testing manages the impact of COVID-19, avoiding in-person testing (new)		Provision of location and support for weekend wānanga	Participants pass Toi Reo Māori	Increase the number of active translators and interpreters	Māori aged 15 and over use te reo Māori as much as English
Remuneration for Toi Reo Māori achievement					
Enable large volumes of people to undertake Toi Reo Māori through online training (new)		Licensed interpreters and translators' expertise for delivery and assessment			

15. Outputs are the direct products of a programme's activities and may include types, levels and targets of services.

16. These short-term outcomes have been generated based on (initial) understanding of programme.

17. These outcomes have been taken from Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori Statement of Intent 2020–2024 and Maihi Karauna 2019–2023.

18. In Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori 2021/22 budget.